

G.A. Alpyspaeva* , G. Zhuman , K.V. Dzhumagaliyeva *S. Seifullin Kazakh Agrotechnical Research University, Astana, Kazakhstan*
(E-mail: galpyspaeva@mail.ru, guliktim@mail.ru, dz_kylashv@mail.ru)

State-Confessional Relations in Kazakhstan (1940–1990): a Historiographical Review

Based on a critical analysis of previously published studies by domestic and foreign authors, the article identifies and summarizes the degree of study of the problem of state-confessional relations in Kazakhstan in the 1940–1990. The beginning of research on these issues dates back to Soviet times. In the post-Soviet period, due to the processes of spiritual revival and the formation of historical consciousness, as well as a result of the introduction of previously classified materials and sources into scientific circulation, interest in this issue has increased. The proposed historiographical review is organized according to the chronological method. The works of domestic and foreign researchers actualize the problems of the legal status of religious denominations, consider various aspects of the practical implementation of Soviet religious legislation, analyze the consequences of errors and miscalculations made in the course of the struggle against the activities of religious organizations, show the causality of excessive anti-religious policy in Kazakhstan, assess the role of religion in the daily life of the population. Such research gaps as forms and methods of anti-religious struggle, mass persecution and repressive policies against the Islamic and Orthodox clergy, the processes of formation and functioning of Muslim religious institutions in Kazakhstan, church diplomacy during the Cold War, religious daily life and other related issues have been highlighted in the works of scientists. At the same time, the urgent tasks of regional analysis and the controversial nature of the problem of relations between the state and religious organizations leave room for new research.

Keywords: state, religious denomination, Kazakhstan, atheism, anti-religious policy, religion, church, Islam, sources, scientific concepts.

Introduction

In recent decades, the problem of state-confessional relations in the designated chronological framework (1940-1990) was quite relevant. The research interest, which attracted the attention of domestic and foreign scholars, is primarily due to the growing number of discussion issues in the process of its study, as well as the presence of different theoretical approaches and assessments of the problem. In the academic environment, in the light of the current religious situation in the republic, due to the peculiarity of the multi-ethnic and multi-confessional structure of the population, interest in the problem is increasing.

The issue of the relationship between the state and religious organizations is one of the most keenly discussed in Kazakhstan. The Republic is a large multi-ethnic and multi-religious state in Central Asia, which leads to the increasing importance of religious organizations in social and political processes. Modern religious organizations have a great influence on the formation of civil society, participate in the settlement of controversial issues and disagreements. In this regard, a comprehensive study of the historical experience of state-confessional relations in the period 1940–1990 is of fundamental importance for the construction of an optimal model of state-confessional policy in Kazakhstan, aimed at strengthening political and social stability. All this together leads to the need for an in-depth historiographical analysis of the chosen topic, in order to identify the information potential of documents and materials on key problems of state-confessional relations in the region in the 1940-1990. This study analyzes key works by domestic and foreign historians whose research has made a considerable contribution to the examination of the problem.

Materials and Methods

The authors used research prepared by domestic and foreign scientists as materials, in which issues of state-confessional relations were considered to one degree or another. The search and selection of literature was carried out using the bibliographic databases Scopus, Google Scholar, Elibrary.ru, the Kazakhstan National Electronic Library, and Cyber link. At the first stage, using keywords (state, confessions, anti-religious policy), a search was conducted for all works that covered the topic of state and religion. These studies are

* Corresponding author's e-mail: galpyspaeva@mail.ru

useful in terms of revealing and understanding the methodological approaches to the problem considered. At the next stage, works for further critical analysis and compilation of a historiographic review, which reflect the regional aspect of the problem, namely state-religious relations in Kazakhstan during the Soviet period were identified and selected. At the final stage, the search for materials was carried out according to specific chronological dates from 1940 to 1990. More than a hundred publications that contained the information necessary for our study and corresponded to the criteria for selecting publications that we had set were identified. The most important criteria for selecting the material were the relevance of the sources for the designated topic and from the point of view of the current level of development of historical science.

When searching for works, the authors did not set time limits for writing articles in order to critically analyze both modern and classical works. The chosen approach allowed us to study and compare Soviet and post-Soviet historiography of the problem. Another selection criterion was to identify various types of research on the problem: articles, monographs, reviews, collections of documents. It was important for us that the researchers' work presented the problem of interaction between the state and religions in different contexts.

The key criterion in selecting the material was objectivity; the authors studied and analyzed different approaches and different points of view on the problem of state-confessional relations to meet this criterion. The proposed historiographical review included all significant studies on the topic. Another important principle was to critically analyze already published studies, identify their strengths and weaknesses, and evaluate the contribution of scientists to the development of the problem.

The study used comparative historical, problem-chronological methods, which together made it possible to reconstruct historical events and facts in the field of state-religious relations in chronological sequence and taking into account cause-and-effect relationships, to reveal the trends and regional features of the process of interaction between the state and religious organizations. Methods of retrospective and prospective analysis allowed us to compare different historical concepts of religious policy in order to identify their common features and characteristics, as well as to identify possible directions and problems of state-confessional relations based on the achievements of modern historiography. Using methods of critical analysis we studied the works of historians, religious scholars, jurists, devoted to the topic of state-confessional relations of the Soviet period of history, analyzed various points of view and scientific conclusions of scientists on the problem. Using the historical-comparative method, a comparative analysis of scientists' interpretations of historical facts and phenomena in the field of relations between the state and religion was carried out. The historical and typological method made it possible to identify common approaches to the study of the designated problem and identify the author's viewpoints.

The fundamental principles in the work are the principle of scientific objectivity and historicism, which allow us to study state-religious relations as a process that has a certain direction and dynamics of development, common features and regional peculiarities, causality.

Results

The issue of state-confessional relations in Kazakhstan in during 1940–1990 period is widely reflected in numerous studies and publications. However, addressing the issues of relations between the state and religion in terms of new methodological approaches, as well as in the context of comparative analysis of these relations in different periods of history, remains an urgent task of domestic historical science.

The works of A.I. Barmenkov [1], M.G. Kirichenko [2], Yu.A. Rozenbaum [3], V.V. Klochkov [4] are devoted to the issues of legislative provision of freedom of conscience in the USSR under the Constitution of 1977. Klochkov [4]. In the works of M.M. Persits [5], V.A. Kuroyedov [6] problems of the legal status of religious denominations, legal aspects of the practical implementation of Soviet religious legislation are considered. In the works of Kazakh authors K. Shulembayev [7] and Sh. Amanturlin [8], V.V. Vostrov [9], A. Argynbayev [10], A. Iskakov [11], based on the analysis of pre-Islamic beliefs of Kazakhs, atheistic ideas are more common. Some works of this period are polemical in nature and written in the manner of a response to “distortions of socialist reality by bourgeois ideologists” [12]. Despite the fact that Soviet legislation in the sphere of religion declared freedom of conscience, state intervention in religious life remained a strategic priority of the state. The dominance of atheistic ideology created obstacles for the objective study of state-confessional relations of the period under study. Only since the second half of the 1980s has Soviet historiography gradually tended to recognize the excesses in the relations of the country's authorities and party functionaries with religious organizations.

Post-Soviet historiography of state-confessional relations in Kazakhstan during the period is represented by the works of domestic authors. A special role in understanding and comprehending the problem from new positions was played by the works of leading researcher Z.G. Saktaganova, who proposed new approaches to assessing the key problems of the relationship between the state and religion. The article by Z.G. Saktaganova is of scientific interest and provides a detailed analysis of the Soviet model of state religious policy in Kazakhstan and the religious daily life of Kazakhstani people in the second half of the XX century. [13]. The author offers her own version of periodization of the state religious policy in the context of its implementation in the republic, concludes about the quantitative growth of religious organizations in different regions of Kazakhstan, despite the intensification of anti-religious struggle.

The history of radical measures of anti-religious policy in Kazakhstan in the pre-war period, as well as historical facts indicating the real softening of the state religious policy during the Great Patriotic War, are presented in the studies of K.T. Bodeyev, Z.G. Saktaganova [14]. The authors note and analyze the consequences of gross mistakes and miscalculations made as a result of the ban on the activities of religious organizations on the territory of the USSR, including in Kazakhstan.

The ambiguous nature of the relationship between the state and religion, manifested from the early days of Soviet power, is revealed in the article by Z.G. Saktaganova, J.S. Mazhitova, E.N. Aimakhov [15]. The authors analyze the legislative basis of religious policy of the Soviet state, forms and methods of anti-religious struggle. The author's assessment of the role of Islam in the everyday life of Kazakh citizens in the second half of the twentieth century deserves special attention. Analyzing the models of state religious policy in various periods of Soviet history, the authors come to the conclusion that religious policy affected every Soviet family and, of course, played a negative role in the spiritual development of society [15; 199].

The problems of state-confessional relations of the Great Patriotic War period were analyzed by A. Baltabayeva [16], G. Kokebayeva, E. Kartabayeva, A. Sadykova [17].

Baltabayeva's article contains a detailed retrospective analysis of the activities of various religious associations in Kazakhstan during the war years, when the mobilization of representatives of different confessions was required. The actual softening of the state religious policy during the war years, in the author's opinion, did not mean the establishment of a relationship of trust between the state and religion. Using specific examples, the author shows the practice of implementing the anti-religious policy of the state locally, conducted to suppress the religious activity of the population.

The authors G. Kokebayeva, E. Kartabayeva, and A. Sadykova focus on the softening of state religious policy during the Great Patriotic War. However, according to the researchers, no drastic changes occurred. In the authors' interpretation, the actions of the Soviet authorities in the sphere of religion were declarative, nominal and largely propagandistic.

The modern domestic historiography is characterized by the appeal of scientists to the study of regional aspects of the problem. Most of the studies are based on the materials of local, regional archives and are devoted to the history of state-confessional relations at the local level. Thus, local-regional studies devoted to the situation of Islam, as well as the history of religious organizations in Central Kazakhstan during the Second World War and the post-war period are contained in the studies of modern Kazakhstani authors [18-23].

The authors characterize the methods and techniques of the authorities' struggle with religious organizations and believers. One of the main topics addressed by the researchers is the daily religious life of Muslims in the central regions of Kazakhstan. Being under the close control of anti-religious propaganda, believers, despite the difficulties created by the official authorities, not only did not abandon their religion, but also demanded religious freedom. The researchers conclude that the propaganda work carried out among the population to instill the basic principles of atheism, did not bring the expected results, and had only relative success.

The everyday religious life of the German population of the northern regions of Kazakhstan in the late 1950s is covered in the work of J.S. Mazhitova, K.M. Ilyasova and others. The authors analyze the religious practices of German communities that made efforts to preserve their culture and identity in the conditions of severe anti-religious struggle [24].

The study of the history of German denominations in Kazakhstan in 1945–1960 is presented in the study by V. Schmidt [25]. The work shows the peculiarities of anti-religious and atheistic propaganda aimed at limiting the activities of Lutherans, Catholics and other religious communities, as well as sectarian groups.

For a reliable scientific study of the problem, studies by Russian authors are of considerable importance. The scope of research and the range of problems covered by Russian scientists is much wider. The

works of Russian colleagues are important in terms of defining methodological approaches to the problem and from the point of view of conceptual analysis of the general state course of religious policy.

The legal status of religious organizations in the Soviet state is considered by L.I. Soskovets [26]. The author emphasizes the restrictive and prohibitive nature of the Soviet legislation on religious denominations, which undermined the principles of freedom of conscience. N.A. Belyakova comes to the same conclusion, justifying the conclusion that in 1980 the registration of religious associations had a restrictive character and was perceived as a way to regulate the religious activity of believers [27].

The evolution of relations between the Soviet authorities and religions in the USSR in 1940-1980 is analyzed by L.A. Koroleva and A.N. Molkin [28]. The history of religious sectarianism in the USSR is considered by R.O. Safronov [29]. The author notes that the Soviet scientific approach to the consideration of sects began to take shape in the 1960s. "The concept of "sect" for both pre-revolutionary and Soviet researchers had a negative meaning: for some in dogmatic terms, for others in ideological terms. Such a long history of negative understanding of the term makes it very difficult to perceive it today as neutral" [29; 112].

A number of works by Russian researchers are devoted to the study of letters from believers to the authorities as valuable historical sources. In the works of N.A. Belyakova, Archpriest A. Sapsay, A. Savin, V. Denningkhaus [30-33], the letters of believers to the authorities are considered through the prism of social history, as an integral part of social protest, as a channel of communication between the population and the authorities in the conditions of absence of other legal forms of expressing discontent and protest [30; 207]. Researchers note the first large-scale statements of believers since the mid-1940s, and in the following years the number of written appeals continued to increase. According to researchers A. Savin and V. Denningkhaus "letters to the authorities" turned into an effective tool for the protection of believers' rights" [33; 118]. The state was concerned about the numerous appeals of believers to international organizations, thus taking corrective actions in the field of state religious policy. In general, we can conclude that letters are a valuable source of information on the topic of our research. Analyzing the written appeals to the authorities, we were able to verify the factual information about the relationship between the authorities and believers, and to trace changes in believers' attitudes in the period 1940-1980.

Issues related to church diplomacy in the context of the "Cold War" are in the focus of attention of researchers A. Beglov and N. Belyakova. The authors analyze the directions of international activity of the Russian Orthodox Church during the period of détente of international tension in the 1970s. [34].

The history of the underground activities of the Church of the Soviet period is considered by A.L. Beglov [35]. In the author's interpretation, the church underground of 1950-1980 persisted in virtually all its forms, characteristic of the 1920-1940 period as well. Unregistered parishes and monasteries continued to exist, pilgrimages to unofficial sanctuaries were made, religious educational circles operated. However, both the scale of distribution and the number of participants in all these types of illegal church life were noticeably narrowed.

The activities of the Council for Religious Cults under the Council of People's Commissars of the USSR (later under the Council of Ministers) were considered in the works of E.V. Nosova [36]. The author summarizes: "The Soviet people became a body of pervasive government control and supervision over the life of believers, and their commissioners — direct implementers of the state policy of harsh pressure on religion and the church" [36; 117].

In Russian historiography there are many works in which the religious policy of the state is considered in the context of individual epochs. The authors, as a rule, emphasize the features characteristic of a given epoch. The works of M.V. Shkarovskii [37] are devoted to the history of the relationship between the Soviet state and the ROC in 1943-1964. The fundamental works of the professor are useful in the study of the interaction between the state and the ROC. State-church relations in 1958-1964, during the years of "Khrushchev's church reform", are considered by A.N. Marchenko [38]. E.V. Goncharenko considers the religious processes and modernization of the Soviet legislation on religious cults in 1964-1982, during the Brezhnev period, characterizing it as the most lenient [39].

A comprehensive analysis of the model of state-confessional relations in the mid-60s — early 80s of the last century is given in the work of A.V. Stambolidi [40]. The work of L.V. Tabunshchikova [41] is devoted to the issues of atheist propaganda in the "period of stagnation" (1965-1985). M.I. Odintsov examines the interaction between the state and religious associations in the USSR in 1985-1990, during the so-called «turning point era». The work is interesting because the author provides information about registered religious associations in the USSR and the Union republics in a comparative aspect. He writes that since the late 1980s "...two divergent processes were forming with increasing speed: centripetal and centrifugal. The union

center tried to preserve the unitary state through “renewal”. The Union republics hoped to strengthen their power through sovereignty. In both cases, the power structures hoped to rely on the authority of religious leaders, masses of believers and religious organizations, on interethnic and national churches” [42]. The reasons for the radical turn in the religious policy of the Soviet state at the boundary between 1987 and 1988 and the importance of the external factor are analyzed by B.A. Filippov [43], I.I. Maslova [44].

Yu.V. Geraskin has been implementing a regional approach to studying the problems of the relationship between church, society and government since the end of 1930–1991, using materials from the regions of Central Russia in his research. The work is interesting in terms of reflection and understanding of the national course of religious policy [45].

Many works by Kazakhstani and Russian authors are devoted to the study of state-Islamic relations during this period. Domestic dissertations are presented by authors G.D. Mukhtarova, B.M. Auanasova and others. G.D. Mukhtarova conceptually analyzes the Islamic policy of the Soviet regime in Kazakhstan, identifies the main stages of its transformation in historical retrospection and in the context of the development of political processes in the country [46]. B.M. Auanasova studies the history of the evolution of religious relations in Kazakhstan in 1941–1991 on the example of Islam [47]. The author focuses on the analysis of the formation of the normative base in the field of religious relations, on the characterization of the religious movement of Muslims, ritualism, reveals the features of Islamic revival in Kazakhstan.

A comprehensive historical and religious analysis of Muslim religious institutions in Kazakhstan is presented in the dissertation of G.T. Konusov [48]. The merit of the author is that he is the first to provide a detailed account of the process of formation and functioning of Muslim religious institutions in Kazakhstan. The activity of the Muslim clergy in the Soviet period is of the greatest interest.

State-Muslim relations in the USSR in 1944-1965 are studied by V.A. Akhmadullin [49]. Reflecting on the problem, the author used a large amount of factual material to carry out a comprehensive analysis of the activities of governmental and administrative bodies and public organizations to build relations with Muslims in the country. Of great interest to researchers are materials on the interaction between the party-state apparatus and the spiritual administrations of Muslims on the organization of trips to Hajj in 1944–1952.

The evolution of state-Islamic relations in the historical aspect is presented in the works of A. Sultangalieva [50]. According to the author, “...at the level of group identification, Islam is one of the elements of Kazakh identity, along with language, ancestral affiliation, awareness of the state as the state of the Kazakh nation, community of historical destiny and territory” [51].

A historical review of the evolution of Islam in Soviet Kazakhstan is also presented in the study by A.A. Mustafayeva [52]. The process of strict state control was observed, resulting in the mass closure of madrasahs and mosques. Special importance is given to the anti-religious campaign initiated by the state in the period from 1920 to 1970.

The authors A.B. Mussagulova and K.D. Arystanbekova consider the struggle of the Soviet authorities against Islam in the context of ideological conditioning of state policy. Their proposed chronology of the evolution of state-religious relations in the country does not fit into the framework of the changing political course of the state [53].

The works of the Russian scientist V.A. Akhmadullin occupied an important place in the historiography of state-Muslim relations in the USSR during the Great Patriotic War, as well as in the post-war period. After defending his doctoral dissertation, V.A. Akhmadullin published a series of articles, where the problem of state-Muslim relations in the period of the Great Patriotic War had been considered in different aspects [54–57]. The author’s research covers a wide range of problems related to the activities of the party-state apparatus of the USSR and the Central Spiritual Administration of Muslims of the USSR during the war years. First of all, these are issues related to the patriotic activities of Muslims, the organization of assistance to the front, the situation of Islam in the postwar period, etc.

Russian authors D.V. Mukhetdinov, V.A. Akhmadullin, J.V. Akhmadullina [58] study the patriotic activities of Soviet Muslim leaders during the Great Patriotic War. On the basis of archival sources, scientists substantiate the thesis that Soviet Muslims from the first days of the war urged their co-religionists to make every effort to destroy the aggressors. The authors’ research is based on archival documents that have been poorly studied and first introduced into scientific circulation, which reflect the peculiarities of state-Muslim relations during the war years.

The activity of the Spiritual Administration of Muslims of the European part of the USSR and Siberia in the system of international relations of the USSR during the “Cold War” (1944–1955) is studied by Z. Khabibullina [59]. The Muslim clergy had to participate in the dissemination of the Soviet ideological pro-

ject abroad, promoting the Soviet way of life and achievements of the country in the conditions of a deep crisis of religious life in the USSR.

The authors L.A. Koroleva and A.A. Korolev study and analyze the practice, specifics, methods of activity of Muslim religious communities in the second half of the 1960s and 1970s at the regional level — in the Middle Volga region [60]. Based on rich historiographical and source material, the researchers present a detailed description of the interaction and mutual influence of government structures with Islamic religious associations.

The English-language historiography of the problem is represented by the works of well-known Western authors. Foreign scholars were interested in the subject of Soviet Islam from the point of view of the influence of the Islamic factor on political processes in the country. The works of A. Bennigsen, E. Tasar, S. Akiner, Yu. Roi, M. Kemper, A.A. Rohrllich [61-67] are devoted to the Muslim question in the USSR. They present a wide range of problems: statistics and demography of Muslim peoples, the institutionalization of Soviet Islam, the activities of CASAM, the muftiyat in the international arena, anti-religious campaigns, issues of secularization of Islam, the genocidal policy against Muslims.

One of the important problems is the religious policy of the Soviet state and state-Muslim relations during the Great Patriotic War. This problem has been attracting the attention of foreign researchers for more than 70 years, because it was during the war years that a radical, turning point in the relationship between the state and religion in Soviet society took place. In our case, a unique work by J. Eden [68] on the situation of Islam and Muslim leaders of the USSR during the Great Patriotic War is of scientific interest. Using rich source material, the author explores the internal and external factors that influenced the religious revival of Islam during the war years. The scholarly value of the book lies in its focus on the experiences and contributions of both the Muslim elite and ordinary Muslims to the common cause of defeating the enemy; informational propaganda, encouraging donations to support the war, etc. In the author's opinion, campaigns to raise money for the war were conducted during religious holidays, with the campaigns themselves providing religious observances with a "legal" cover. J. Eden points to the ambiguity of Soviet policy with regard to religious freedom, especially in terms of the degree of restrictions imposed on religious activity. This inevitably led to confusion among Soviet bureaucrats working in the Soviet republics, and also allowed many Soviet Muslims to engage in their religious practice without significant restrictions.

One of the first researchers who managed to work with the archival documents of the Council for Religious Affairs (CRA) was the Israeli historian Y. Ro'i [64-65]. In his works, the researcher offers his view on the situation of Islam in the USSR in the period from World War II to the rule of M. Gorbachev. Despite the effectiveness of Soviet anti-religious practices and the desire to impose socialist ideology, Islam, according to the author, was able to adapt to changing political circumstances and retained its influence on society.

The history of the Soviet administration's religious policy towards Central Asian Muslims in the post-war period is presented in the book by E. Tasar [62]. It considers the activities of CASAM in the period from 1940–1950, analyzes in detail the development of state-Muslim relations in 1943–1990.

In the widely recognized 1989 publication "Candle in the Wind: Religion in the USSR", eleven authors studied the situation of the Russian Orthodox Church, Protestants, Catholics, <<Orthodox>>, as well as followers of Judaism, Buddhism, and Muslims during the years of Soviet power. The researchers focused their scientific interest on repressive mechanisms against believers and religious organizations, as well as considered the processes of change in Islamic society and its opposition to anti-religious policies [69].

The subject of Soviet religious policy, based on numerous statistical data in the field of socio-cultural life in Central Asia, was covered in the book by M. Ryvkin [70].

The topic of church-state relations in the USSR is thoroughly developed in the works of D. Pospelovskii, W. Fletcher, and D. Ellis [71–76]. Thus, unique material based on rich and little-known historical material from Russian and foreign archives on the history of the Russian Orthodox Church in the period from 1917–1982 is presented in the book by D. Pospelovskii, professor emeritus of history at the University of Western Ontario (Canada). The author identifies and reveals the history of mass persecution of the Church during the period from the 1930s to the 1960s of the twentieth century. The author writes about the patriotic activities of the church during the war years. Of great interest are historical documents on the position and status of the Russian Orthodox Church abroad.

Of interest is also the book by researcher W. Fletcher, in which the author reveals the history of severe persecution of the Russian Orthodox Church in the pre-war period, as well as explores the changes in Soviet religious policy during World War II, characterized by the warming of church-state relations.

D. Ellis writes about the underground religious life of the Russian Orthodox Church in 1950–1980. The book is of great scientific interest and contains much historical material on the struggle of Orthodox believers against the continuous and systematic eradication of religion.

A critical analysis of anti-religious propaganda in the USSR is presented by D.E. Powell [77]. The British author recognized that the numerous campaigns to spread the atheistic worldview among the Soviet people were utopian, unable to finally destroy religious faith in the public consciousness of the masses. The history of the formation of the first anti-religious organizations in the USSR is studied by American professor D. Delaney [78]. The scientist believes that the ideological agenda of the latter was formed under the influence of the internal party struggle and at the same time acted as one of the means of this struggle. The legal aspects of Soviet religious education are studied by J. Rothenberg [79].

One of the most fundamental works in the field of Soviet ideology on the formation of the system of atheism is the study by V. Smolkin (Wesleyan University, USA) “Vacancy is a chance to take at first glance” [80]. The author, relying on a wide range of sources represented by archival documents, memoirs, periodicals and interviews, explores the history of Soviet atheism in the period from 1917–1991. He concludes that as a result of increased pressure of the Communist Party on believers and the use of various ways of imposing restrictions on their religious activities, the state failed to destroy religion and create an atheist society.

Discussion

The historiography of the problem includes a wide range of works from the Soviet and modern periods. The historiographical review is organized according to the problem-chronological principle, which makes it possible to consider the main problems of the topic in chronological overview.

In Soviet historiography, which developed within the methodological framework of the formational approach, the paradigm of opposing the church to the state as an ideological opponent prevailed, and the problem of state-religious relations was considered in the context of the ideological attitude of the state. This approach influenced the nature and content of the works, the ideological orientation of which did not go beyond the limits allowed by the official ideology. The authors interpreted the legal norms of state-confessional relations in the context of solving the state task — to educate the Soviet person with anti-religious and atheistic worldview, exaggerating the role and importance of atheistic propaganda. Post-Soviet historiography of the problem is characterized, first of all, by the expansion of the source base of research, attempts of researchers to overcome the stereotypes of the “Soviet approach”, to reconsider the mistakes of the past and approach the study of the topic from a scientific point of view. Post-Soviet historiography of the problem is characterized, first of all, by the expansion of the source base of research, attempts of researchers to overcome the stereotypes of the “Soviet approach”, to reconceive the mistakes of the past and approach the study of the topic from a scientific point of view. Indeed, the actions of the Soviet government in the sphere of religion were considered to be primarily propagandistic.

It is certain that the works of contemporary Kazakhstani authors significantly expand the research field of the problem and make an essential contribution to the study of regional aspects of interaction between the state and religions. The authors of this article agree with the point of view of G. Kokebayeva, E. Kartabayeva, A. Sadykova that during the Great Patriotic War there were no radical changes in the relations between the state and religions. Indeed, the actions of the Soviet government in the sphere of religion were considered to be largely propaganda in its nature. However, it should be noted that it was during the war years that the religious movement was revived, the state gradually returned objects of worship to believers, anti-religious propaganda was partially curtailed, and the “Union of Militant Atheists” was liquidated.

It is impossible to agree with the chronology of the evolution of state-religious relations in the country proposed by the authors A.B. Musagulova and K.D. Arystanbekova, since it does not fit into the framework of the changing political course of the state. Thus, the authors characterize 1980–1991 as a “period of tough relations between the state and Islam,” although since the mid-1980s, with the beginning of Gorbachev’s “perestroika” policy, some relaxation has been observed in relation to religion.

The question of the chronological periods of the evolution of the relationship between the Soviet state and Islam is debatable. The authors L.A. Koroleva and A.A. Korolev distinguish several periods in state-Islamic relations. I period — 1920, when “the Muslim clergy retained influence on a significant part of believers and seriously resisted the Soviet authorities. II period — the end of 1920–1941, when “in the areas of the traditional spread of Islam, Sharia courts were abolished, religious sanctions lost their legal force, and the Muslim clergy became more loyal to the Soviet authorities”. Period III — after the Great Patriotic War, according to the authors, it was “characterized by a mass departure of believers from religion, which was an objective “natural result of radical socio-economic and cultural transformations” [60]. It is difficult to agree

with such a periodization, in any case, the relationship between the state and Islam in Kazakhstan does not fit into such an interpretation of transformation. Up until the end of 1920, the state showed a loyal position towards the Muslims of Kazakhstan and Central Asia.

In relation to the Kazakhstan region, the concept of foreign Islamic Sovietologists is closer, who distinguish the following periods: Stage I — from 1918 to the mid-1980s. (the “Red Guard attack” on Islam); Stage II — from 1945 to the middle of 1980 (“disguised suppression of the Muslim cult under the guise of atheistic propaganda”); Stage III — since the mid-1980s. (“support and use of the Muslim religion, < ministers of worship > and Islamic associations to achieve their goals”). According to foreign Sovietologists, a major role in the transformation of state-Islamic relations was played not only by internal reasons (the coming to power of M. Gorbachev and the beginning of perestroika policy), but mainly by external factors — the introduction of Soviet troops into Afghanistan, the Islamic revolution in Iran [60; 110].

Conclusions

The historiographical review of the main studies on the problems of state-religious relations in Kazakhstan (1940–1990) allows us to formulate the following conclusions.

Most modern studies of Kazakhstani authors (N. Nurtazina, A. Zhanbosinova, J.A. Begasilova, S.T. Rysbekova, etc.) are devoted to the study of the initial Soviet period (the 1920s–1930s) of state-religious interaction, or to the contemporary period of relations, already in independent Kazakhstan (G.S. Sapargaliyeva, A.G. Kosichenko, G.J. Raimbekova, N. Asanbayev, etc.). In this regard, the task of studying the relationship between the state and religious movements in Kazakhstan in our proposed chronological period of 1940–1990 is of particular relevance.

The periodization of the Soviet state religious policy in Kazakhstan (1917–1929, 1929–1941, 1941–1953, 1954–1964 and 1964–1991), proposed by scientist Z.G. Saktaganova, more objectively reflects the processes that took place in the relationship between the state and religion in Kazakhstan. In these years, the denominational picture in the republic changed significantly, which was facilitated by Stalin’s deportation of peoples (1930–1940) and the development of virgin lands (1950–1960). Since 1940, a new concept of religious policy of the Soviet state has been formed, different from the model of rigid administrative suppression of religion in 1920–1930. This turn was due not only to the civic stance of the church and clergy during the Great Patriotic War, but also to external reasons. With the country’s transition to a new model of socio-political development in the early 1990s, the interaction between the state and religious organizations turned to a completely different perspective.

The historiographical review indicates a significant, but far from complete, degree of study of the problem of interaction between the state and denominations in Kazakhstan in 1940–1990. The number of lacunas to be studied is still considerable. The topic of state-religious relations in its regional aspect and on the basis of previously unused documentary sources from the funds of regional archives remains promising for future research. The problem of state–religion relations in Kazakhstan during 1940–1990 has not been fully explored from a comparative perspective across different historical periods: the Second World War, the Khrushchev era (1953–1964), the Brezhnev era (1965–1985), and the period of Gorbachev’s perestroika (1985–1990). Meanwhile, even in these relatively small chronological periods, there was an evolution in the relationship between the state and religious communities due to political processes in the country. Regional peculiarities of the religious structure of Kazakhstani society and evolutionary processes in the religious policy of the state should be studied.

The issues of anti-religious activities of the state in 1954–1964, known as “Khrushchev’s church reform” in their regional context, in particular in Kazakhstan, remain practically unexplored. The questions of creation of the organizational center of Muslims of Kazakhstan remain unanswered: why the Spiritual Administration of Muslims of Kazakhstan was established only after the Republic gained independence, and why Muslims in Kazakhstan lacked such a center throughout the Soviet period. In the context of the above, the study of legal, ideological, organizational, political, socio-cultural aspects of interaction between the authorities and religious organizations in the region is quite relevant.

Acknowledgments

The research was carried out within the framework of the project “Historical experience of state-confessional relations in Kazakhstan (1940–1990)” under the grant funding program of the Committee of Science of the Ministry of Science and Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan (Project IRN: AP 23486006).

References

- 1 Барменков А.И. Свобода совести в СССР / А.И. Барменков. — Москва: Мысль, 1986. — 224 с.
- 2 Кириченко М.Г. Свобода совести в СССР / М.Г. Кириченко. — Москва: Наука, 1985. — 198 с.
- 3 Розенбаум Ю.А. Советское государство и церковь / Ю.А. Розенбаум. — Москва: Наука, 1985. — 173 с.
- 4 Клочков В.В. Религия, государство, право / В.В. Клочков. — Москва: Мысль, 1978. — 287 с.
- 5 Персиц М.М. Отделение церкви от государства и школы от церкви / М.М. Персиц. — Москва: изд-во АН СССР, 1958. — 198 с.
- 6 Куроедов О.А. Религия и церковь в советском обществе / О.А. Куроедов. — Москва, 1984. — 265 с.
- 7 Шулембаев К. Образ жизни. Религия. Атеизм / К. Шулембаев. — Алма-Ата: Казахстан, 1983. — 263 с.
- 8 Амантурлин Ш. Пережитки анимизма, шаманства, ислама и атеистическая работа / Ш. Амантурлин. — Алма-Ата: Изд-во Каз. пед. ин-т, 1977. — 134 с.
- 9 Востров В.В. К вопросу о пережитках древних верований у казахов / В.В. Востров // Известия АН КазССР. Сер.: История, археология и этнография. — 1956. — Вып. 2. — С. 51–60.
- 10 Аргынбаев А. Семья и брак у казахов / А. Аргынбаев. — Алма-Ата: Наука, 1973. — 327с.
- 11 Исаков А. Суеверия и религиозные обряды / А. Исаков. — Алма-Ата, 1968. — 107 с.
- 12 Белов А.В. Миф о «религиозном возрождении» в СССР / А.В. Белов. — М.: Знание, 1983. — 64 с.
- 13 Сактаганова З.Г. Советская модель государственной религиозной политики в Казахстане и религиозная повседневность казахстанцев во второй половине XX века / З.Г. Сактаганова // История повседневности. — 2017. — 1(3). — С. 60–76.
- 14 Бодеев К.Т. Политика Советской власти по отношению к религиозным организациям в Казахстане (30–40 годы XX века) [Электронный ресурс] / К.Т. Бодеев, Г.Г. Сактаганова. — Режим доступа: <https://history-philosophy-vestnik.ksu.kz/index.php/history-philosophy-vestnik/article/view/184/147>. — 05.07.2024.
- 15 Сактаганова З.Г. Государство и религия в советской истории: этапы и особенности взаимоотношений в Казахстане / З.Г. Сактаганова, Ж.С. Мажитова, Е.Н. Аймахов // Вестник КазНПУ. — 2017. — № 2 (53). — С. 191–200.
- 16 Балтабаева А.М. Особенности религиозной жизни Казахстана в период Великой Отечественной войны [Электронный ресурс] / А.М. Балтабаева. — Режим доступа: <https://articlekz.com/article/5034> — 29.06.2024
- 17 Kokebayeva G. The evolution of soviet power's religious policy during the great patriotic war / G. Kokebayeva, Y. Kartabayeva, A. Sadykova // Asian Social Science. — 2015. — Vol. 11. — No. 13. — P. 235–239.
- 18 Bodeyev K. History of the development of religious organizations in central Kazakhstan / K. Bodeyev, Z. Saktaganova, A. Myrzakmetova, Sh. Pyassov, Zh. Kenzhegali. — 2019. — Opcion. — 35(90-2). — P. 772–783.
- 19 Бодеев К.Т. Методы и приемы борьбы советской власти с религиозными организациями в 40–50-е гг. XX века (на примере Центрального Казахстана) [Электронный ресурс] / К.Т. Бодеев. — Режим доступа: <https://www.permgaspi.ru/deyatelnost/november-readings/noyabrskie-istoriko-arhivnye-chteniya-v-permskom-partarhive-v-2019-godu/materialy-nauchnoj-konferentsiii-noyabrskie-istoriko-arhivnye-chteniya-2019-g/metody-i-priemy-borby-sovetskoj-vlasti-s-religioznymi-organizatsiyami-v-40-50-e-gg-hh-veka-na-primere-tsentralnogo-kazahstana.html> — 05.07.2024.
- 20 Сактаганова З.Г. Ислам в повседневной жизни Центрального Казахстана в 1940-х гг. / З.Г. Сактаганова, К.Т. Бодеев // «Реформы в повседневной жизни населения России: история и современность»: сб. материалов Междунар. науч. конф. — Санкт-Петербург, 2020. — С. 250–254.
- 21 Бодеев К.Т. Қарағанды облысындағы діни ұйымдар тарихы (XX ғ. 60 ж. ортасы) / К.Т. Бодеев, З.Г. Сактаганова // Қарағанды университетінің хабаршысы. Тарих. Философия сериясы. — 2020. — № 1(97). — Б. 57–67.
- 22 Сактаганова З.Г. Власть и религиозные конфессии в 1950-е гг. (на материалах Центрального Казахстана) / З.Г. Сактаганова, З.А. Ильяшева // Теоретические и прикладные исследования в религиоведении: сб. ст., посвящен памяти доктора философских наук, профессора А.Ф. Управителяева. — Барнаул: Алтайск. гос. университет, 2009. — С. 430–439.
- 23 Сактаганова З.Г. «Синдром послевоенной жертвенности» и религиозная повседневность населения Центрального Казахстана в 1940–1950-е гг. / З.Г. Сактаганова // Столица и провинции: взаимоотношения центра и регионов в истории России: сб. ст. — Санкт-Петербург, 28 апреля, 2017. — С. 135–140.
- 24 Mazhitova Z.S. (n.d.). Every day religious Life of German Population in North Kazakhstan region in the Late 1950s. / Z.S. Mazhitova, K.M. Pyassova // European Journal of Science and Theology. — Vol. 18. — No (5). — P. 105–122.
- 25 Шмидт В. Немецкие конфессии Казахстана в 1945–1960 гг. / В. Шмидт // Восточный архив. — 2021. — № 1(43). — С. 85–90.
- 26 Сосковец Л.И. Правовое положение религиозных организаций в советском государстве / Л.И. Сосковец // Ученые записки Санкт-Петербургского им. В.Б. Бобкова филиала Российской таможенной академии. — 2003. — 1(20). — С. 310–322.
- 27 Белякова Н.А. Власть и религиозные объединения в «позднем» СССР: проблема регистрации / Н.А. Белякова // Отечественная история. — 2008. — № 4. — С. 124–130.

- 28 Королева Л.А. Власть и религия в СССР. 1940-1980 гг. [Электронный ресурс] / Л.А. Королева, А.Н. Молькин // История и археология. — 2014. — № 8. — Режим доступа: <https://history.snauka.ru/2014/08/1123> — 15.06.2024.
- 29 Сафронов Р.О. Изучение сект в советском религиоведении: терминология и подходы / Р.О. Сафронов // Вестник Православного Свято-Тихоновского гуманитарного университета. I: Богословие. Философия. — 2013. — Вып. 5(49). — С. 96–112.
- 30 Белякова Н.А. Советские по стилю, религиозные по содержанию. Письма верующих во власть в период позднего социализма / Н.А. Белякова // Российская история. — 2019. — № 1. — С. 207–214.
- 31 Белякова Н.А. «Сообщаем о преступлении против правосудия...»: обращения и жалобы верующих в брежневском СССР / Н.А. Белякова // Новейшая история России. — 2018. — Т. 8. — № 3. — С. 640–658.
- 32 Протоиерей Сапсай А. Письма, жалобы, обращения православных верующих Прикамья в органы власти в период позднего социализма / А. Сапсай // Вестник свято-филаретовского института. — 2023. — Вып. 48. — С. 209–227.
- 33 Савин А. «Письма во власть» как модус религиозного диссидентства в брежневскую эпоху / А. Савин, В. Деннигхаус // Россия XXI. — 2017 — № 6. — С. 118–141.
- 34 Beglov A. Church Diplomacy in the Conditions of the Cold War: Directions of International Activity of the Russian Orthodox Church during the Period of Detente International Tension in the 1970s / A. Beglov, N. Belyakova // Istoriiia. — 2021. — 12 (11). DOI: 10.18254/S207987840017593-1 — 18.06.2024.
- 35 Беглов А.Л. Церковное подполье в 1950–1980-е гг.: основные тенденции / А.Л. Беглов // Альфа и Омега. — 2008. — 3 (53). — С. 351–368.
- 36 Носова Е.В. Деятельность Совета по делам религиозных культов / Е.В. Носова // Вестник КРСУ. — 2009. — Т. 9. — № 5. — С. 113–117.
- 37 Шкаровский М.В. Русская Православная Церковь в XX веке / М.В. Шкаровский. — Москва: Вече: Лепта, 2010. — 478 с.
- 38 Марченко А.Н. «Хрущевская церковная реформа» и ее влияние на внутрицерковную жизнь: по материалам уральского региона (1958–1964 гг.): авт. дис. ... д-ра ист. наук: Спец.09.00.13. — «Религиоведение, философская антропология, философия культуры» / А.Н. Марченко. — М., 2008. — 64 с.
- 39 Гончаренко Е.В. Модернизация советского законодательства о религиозных культах в 1964–1982 гг. (период Л.И. Брежнева) / Е.В. Гончаренко // Исторические исследования: сб. материалов III Междунар. науч. конф. — Казань: Бук, 2015. — С. 49–52.
- 40 Стамболиди А.В. Государственно-конфессиональные отношения в СССР в середине 60-х начале 80-х годов XX века: автореф. дис. ... канд. ист. наук: Спец. 09.00.13. — «Религиоведение, философская антропология, философия культуры» / А.В. Стамболиди. — М., 2009. — 24 с.
- 41 Табунщикова Л.В. Религиозная жизнь и атеистическая деятельность советского государства в период «застоя» (на материалах Ростовской области) / Л.В. Табунщикова // Известия высших учебных заведений. Северо-Кавказский регион. Общественные науки. — 2011. — № 5. — С. 40–43.
- 42 Одинцов М.И. Вероисповедные реформы в Советском Союзе и в России. 1985–1997 гг. / М.И. Одинцов. — М.: Российское объединение исследователей религии, 2010. — 444 с.
- 43 Филиппов Б.А. Влияние советско-американских переговоров 1985–1989 гг. на изменение советской вероисповедной политики: исторические и политические контексты визита М. Горбачева в Ватикан / Б.А. Филиппов // Вестник Православного Свято-Тихоновского гуманитарного университета. Серия II: История. История Русской Православной Церкви. — 2022. — Вып. 105. — С. 124–153.
- 44 Маслова И.И. Государственно-конфессиональная политика в СССР: поворот курса в 1985–1988 гг. / И.И. Маслова // Известия высших учебных заведений. Поволжский регион. Гуманитарные науки. — 2015. — № 4 (36). — С. 43–54.
- 45 Гераськин Ю.В. Взаимоотношений русской православной церкви, общества и власти в конце 1930-х -1991 гг. (на материалах областей Центральных России): автореф. дис. ... д-ра ист. наук: 07.00.02, дата защиты 26.03.2009 / Ю.В. Гераськин. — М., 2009. — 49 с.
- 46 Мухтарова Г.Д. Ислам в советском Казахстане: дис. ... д-ра ист. наук: 07.00.02 / Г.Д. Мухтарова. — Уральск, 2007. — 310 с.
- 47 Ауанасова Б.М. История эволюции религиозных отношений в Казахстане (на примере ислама 1941–1991 гг.): дис. ... канд. ист. наук: 07.00.02 / Б.М. Ауанасова. — Уральск, 2007. — 135 с.
- 48 Конусов Г.В. Мусульманские религиозные институты в Казахстане (историко-религиоведческий анализ): автореф. дис. ... канд. философ. наук: 09.00.14 / Г.В. Конусов. — Душанбе, 2012. — 21 с.
- 49 Ахмадуллин В.А. Государственно-мусульманские отношения в СССР в 1944–1965 гг.: дис. ... д-ра ист. наук: 07.00.02 / В.А. Ахмадуллин. — М., 2020. — 538 с.
- 50 Султангалиева А. Ислам в Казахстане: история, этничность и общество / А. Султангалиева. — Алматы, 1996. — 173 с.

- 51 Султангалиева А. Эволюция ислама в Казахстане [Электронный ресурс] / А. Султангалиева // Центральная Азия и Кавказ. — 1999. — № 4 (5). — Режим доступа: https://ca-c.org.ru/journal/1999/cac-05-1999/st_06_sultangal.shtml.
- 52 Мустафаева А.А. Исторический обзор эволюции ислама в советском Казахстане / А.А. Мустафаева // Вестник Казахского национального университета. — 2012. — № 3 (60). — С. 31–35.
- 53 Мусагулова А.Б. Борьба советской власти против религии и ее отрицательные последствия в национальном самосознании / А.Б. Мусагулова, К.Д. Арыстанбекова // Вестник Казахского национального педагогического университета. — 2015. — № 1. — С. 26–33.
- 54 Ахмадуллин В.А. Деятельность Советского государства и духовных управлений мусульман по организации паломничества (1944–1965 гг.): анализ исторического опыта и значение для современности: монография / В.А. Ахмадуллин. — М.: Издательский дом «Исламская книга», 2016. — 208 с.
- 55 Ахмадуллин В.А. Деятельность партийно-государственного аппарата СССР и Центрального Духовного Управления Мусульман по сплочению населения и организации помощи фронту в первом периоде Великой Отечественной войны (июнь 1941 — ноябрь 1942 гг.) / В.А. Ахмадуллин // Военный академический журнал. — 2015. — № 2 (6). — С. 38–46.
- 56 Ахмадуллин В.А. Патриотическая деятельность мусульман России в годы Великой Отечественной войны (по материалам совета по делам религиозных культов при СНК СССР / В.А. Ахмадуллин // Вестник Российского университета дружбы народов, серия История России. — 2016. — № 1. — С. 91–100.
- 57 Ахмадуллин В.А. Изучение особенностей исламской жизни Советом по делам религиозных культов при СНК СССР/СМ СССР в первое послевоенное десятилетие / В.А. Ахмадуллин // Исламоведение. — 2019. — Т. 10. — № 2. — С. 59–75.
- 58 Мухетдинов Д.В. Патриотические обращения руководителей советских мусульман к единоверцам в годы Великой Отечественной войны [Электронный ресурс] / Д.В. Мухетдинов, В.А. Ахмадуллин, Ж.В. Ахмадуллина // Minbar. Islamic Studies. — 2020. — № 13 (2). — С. 307–329. — Режим доступа: <https://www.minbar.su/jour/article/view/758>.
- 59 Khabibullina Z. Spiritual administration of muslims of the European part of the USSR and Siberia in the system of international contacts of the USSR during the cold war (1944–1955) [Electronic resource] / Z. Khabibullina // Istoriiia. — 2021. — Vol. 12. — Issue 8 (106). — Режим доступа: <https://history.jes.su/s207987840016713-3-1/?sl=en>.
- 60 Королева Л.А. Ислам, государство, общество в СССР во второй половине 1960-х — первой половине 1980-х гг. (по материалам Среднего Поволжья): монография / Л.А. Королева, А.А. Королев. — Пенза: ПГУАС, 2014. — 228 с.
- 61 Bennigsen A. Muslims of the Soviet Empire: A Guide / A. Bennigsen, S.E. Wimbush. — Indiana University Press, 1986. — 294 p.
- 62 Tasar E. Soviet and Muslim: the institutionalization of Islam in Central Asia, 1943–1991 / E. Tasar. — New York, NY: Oxford University Press, 2017. — 409 p.
- 63 Akiner S. Islamic Peoples of the Soviet Union: with an Appendix. On the Non-muslim Turkic Peoples of the Soviet Union: an Historical and Statistical Handbook / S. Akiner. — London: KPI, 1986. — 462 p.
- 64 Ro'i Y. "The Secularisation of Islam and the USSR's Muslim Areas" / Y. Ro'i // Muslim Eurasia: Conflicting Legacies. — London: Frank Cass, 1995. — P. 5–20.
- 65 Ro'i Y. Islam in the Soviet Union: From the Second World War to Gorbachev / Y. Ro'i. — London: C. Hurst, 2000. — 764 p.
- 66 Kemper M. Studying Islam in the Soviet Union / M. Kemper. — Amsterdam: University of Amsterdam Press, 2009. — 27 p.
- 67 Rorlich A.-A. "Islam and Atheism: Dynamic Tension in Soviet Central Asia" / A.-A. Rorlich // Soviet Central Asia: The Failed Transformation / ed. W. FIERMAN. — London: Westview Press, 1991. — P. 186–218.
- 68 Eden J. God Save the USSR: Soviet Muslims and the Second World War / J. Eden. — Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2021. — 272 p.
- 69 Shirley E.B. Candle in the wind: religion in the Soviet Union / E.B. Shirley, Jr., M. Rowe. — Washington: Ethics and Public Policy Center, 1989. — 328 p.
- 70 Rywkin M. Moscow's Muslim challenge: Soviet Central Asia / M. Rywkin. — N.Y.: M.E. Sharpe, 1990. — 5 p.
- 71 Pospelovsky D. The Russian church under the Soviet regime, 1917–1982 / D. Pospelovsky. — Crestwood, NY: St Vladimir's Seminary Press, 1984. — 264 p.
- 72 Поспеловский Д.В. Русская Православная Церковь в XX веке / Д.В. Поспеловский. — М.: Республика, 1995. — 511 с.
- 73 Поспеловский Д.В. Тоталитаризм и вероисповедание / Д.В. Поспеловский. — М.: Библейско-богословский ин-т св. апостола Андрея, 2003. — 655 с.
- 74 Pospelovsky D. A History of Marxist-Leninist atheism and soviet antireligions policies / D. Pospelovsky. — London, 1987. — 189 p.
- 75 Fletcher W. The Russian Orthodox Church underground, 1917–1970 / W. Fletcher. — Oxford, 1971. — 332 p.
- 76 Эллис Д. Русская Православная Церковь. Согласие и инакомыслие / Д. Эллис; пер. с англ. Г. Сидоренко. — London: Overseas Publications Interchange LTD, 1990. — 307 с.

77 Powell D.E. Antireligious propaganda in the Soviet Union: a study in mass persuasion / D.E. Powell. — Cambridge, MA: MIT Press, 1975. — 230 p.

78 Delaney J. The Origins of Soviet Antireligious Organizations / J. Delaney // Aspects of Religion in the Soviet Union, 1917–1967 / ed. R. Marshall. — Chicago: Univ. of Chicago press, 1971. — P. 103–130.

79 Rothenberg O.J. “The Legal Aspect of Religious Education in the Soviet Union” / O.J. Rothenberg // Comparative Education Review. — 1968. — No. 1. — P. 68–75.

80 Смолкин В. Свято место пусто не бывает: история советского атеизма / В. Смолкин; пер. с англ. О.Б. Леонтьевой. — Москва: Новое литературное обозрение, 2021. — 548 с.

Г.А. Алпыспаева, Г. Жұман, К.В. Джумагалиева

Қазақстандағы мемлекеттік-конфессиялық қатынастар (1940–1990 жж.): тарихнамалық шолу

Мақалада отандық және шетелдік авторлардың бұрын жарияланған зерттеулерін сыни талдау негізінде 1940-1990 жылдардағы Қазақстандағы мемлекеттік-конфессиялық қатынастар проблемасын зерделеу дәрежесі анықталды және жинақталды. Айқындалған мәселелер бойынша зерттеулердің басталуы кеңес заманында басталды. Посткеңестік кезеңде рухани жаңғыру және тарихи сананы қалыптастыру процестеріне байланысты, сондай-ақ бұрын жіктелген материалдар мен дереккөздерді ғылыми айналымға енгізу нәтижесінде бұл мәселеге қызығушылық артты. Ұсынылған тарихнамалық шолу проблемалық-хронологиялық принципке негізделген. Отандық және шетелдік зерттеушілердің еңбектерінде діни конфессиялардың құқықтық мәртебесі мәселелері өзектендіріледі, кеңестік діни заңнаманы іс жүзінде іске асырудың әр түрлі аспектілері қаралады, діни ұйымдардың қызметіне қарсы күрес барысында жіберілген қателіктер мен қате есептеулердің салдары талданады, Қазақстандағы дінге қарсы саясаттың шектен шығуының себеп-салдарлық шарттылығы көрсетіледі; халықтың күнделікті өміріндегі діннің рөлі бағаланады. Ғалымдардың еңбектерінде дінге қарсы күрестің нысандары мен әдістері, ислам және православие дін басыларына қатысты жаппай қуғын-сүргін және репрессиялық саясат, Қазақстандағы мұсылман діни институттарының қалыптасу және жұмыс істеу процесі, «қырғи қабақ соғыс» жылдарындағы шіркеу дипломатиясы және т.б. аспектілер қамтылды. Сонымен қатар, өңірлік зерттеудің өзекті міндеттері мен мемлекет пен діни ұйымдар арасындағы қарым-қатынас проблемасының пікірталас сипаты жаңа зерттеулерге мүмкіндік береді.

Кілт сөздер: мемлекет, конфессиялар, Қазақстан, атеизм, дінге қарсы саясат, дін, шіркеу, ислам, дереккөздер, ғылыми тұжырымдамалар.

Г.А. Алпыспаева, Г. Жұман, К.В. Джумагалиева

Государственно-конфессиональные отношения в Казахстане (1940–1990 гг.): историографический обзор

В статье на основе критического анализа ранее опубликованных исследований отечественных и зарубежных авторов выявлена и обобщена степень изученности проблемы государственно-конфессиональных отношений в Казахстане в 1940–1990 годы. Начало исследований по обозначенной проблематике было положено еще в советское время. В постсоветский период, в связи с процессами духовного возрождения и формирования исторического сознания, а также в результате введения в научный оборот ранее засекреченных материалов и источников, интерес к данному вопросу возрос. Предлагаемый историографический обзор построен по проблемно-хронологическому принципу. В трудах отечественных и зарубежных исследователей актуализируются проблемы правового статуса религиозных конфессий, рассматриваются различные аспекты практической реализации советского религиозного законодательства, анализируются последствия ошибок и просчетов, допущенных в ходе борьбы с деятельностью религиозных организаций, показана причинно-следственная обусловленность перегибов антирелигиозной политики в Казахстане; дается оценка роли религии в повседневной жизни населения. В работах ученых нашли освещение такие аспекты, как формы и методы антирелигиозной борьбы, массовые гонения и репрессивная политика в отношении исламского и православного духовенства, процесс становления и функционирования мусульманских религиозных институтов в Казахстане, церковная дипломатия в годы «холодной войны» и другие. Вместе с тем, актуальные задачи регионального изучения и дискуссионный характер проблемы взаимоотношений государства и религиозных организаций оставляют возможности для новых исследований.

Ключевые слова: государство, конфессии, Казахстан, атеизм, антирелигиозная политика, религия, церковь, ислам, источники, научные концепции.

References

- 1 Barmenkov, A.I. (1986). *Svoboda sovesti v SSSR* [Freedom of conscience in the USSR]. Moscow: Mysl [in Russian].
- 2 Kirichenko, M.G. (1985). *Svoboda sovesti v SSSR* [Freedom of conscience in the USSR]. Moscow: Nauka [in Russian].
- 3 Rozenbaum, Yu.A. (1985). *Sovetskoe gosudarstvo i tserkov* [The Soviet state and the Church]. Moscow: Nauka [in Russian].
- 4 Klochkov, V.V. (1978). *Religiia, gosudarstvo, pravo* [Religion, State, Law]. Moscow: Mysl [in Russian].
- 5 Persits, M.M. (1958). *Otdelenie tserkvi ot gosudarstva i shkoly ot tserkvi* [Separation of church from State and school from church]. Moscow: Izdatelstvo Akademii Nauk SSSR [in Russian].
- 6 Kuroyedov, O.A. (1984). *Religiia i tserkov v sovetskom obshchestve* [Religion and the Church in Soviet society]. Moscow: Znanie [in Russian].
- 7 Shulembayev, K. (1983). *Obraz zhizni. Religiia. Ateizm* [Lifestyle. Religion. Atheism]. Alma-Ata: Kazakhstan [in Russian].
- 8 Amanturlin, Sh. (1977). *Perezhitki animizma, shamanstva, islama i ateisticheskaia rabota* [Remnants of animism, shamanism, Islam, and atheistic work]. Alma-Ata: Izdatelstvo Kazakhskogo pedagogicheskogo instituta [in Russian].
- 9 Vostrov, V.V. (1956). K voprosu o perezhitkakh drevnikh verovaniu u kazakhov [On the question of the remnants of ancient beliefs among the Kazakhs]. *Izvestiia Akademii Nauk KazSSR. Seriya: Istorii, arheologiya i etnografiia — The Izvestia of the Academy of Sciences of the Kazakh SSR. Series: History, archeology and ethnography*, 2, 51–60 [in Russian].
- 10 Argynbayev, A. (1973). *Semia i brak u kazakhov* [Kazakh family and marriage]. Alma-Ata: Nauka [in Russian].
- 11 Isakov, A. (1968). *Sueverii i religioznye obiady* [Superstitions and religious rituals]. Alma-Ata: Nauka [in Russian].
- 12 Belov, A.V. (1983). *Mif o «religioznom vozrozhdenii» v SSSR* [The myth of the “religious revival” in the USSR]. Moscow: Znanie [in Russian].
- 13 Saktaganova, Z.G. (2017). Sovetskaia model gosudarstvennoi religioznoi politiki v Kazakhstane i religioznaia povsednevnost kazakhstantsev vo vtoroi polovine XX v. [Soviet model of state religious policy in Kazakhstan and religious everyday life of Kazakhs in the second half of the twentieth century]. *Istorii povsednevnosti—History of everyday life*, 1(3), 60–76 [in Russian].
- 14 Bodeev, K.T., & Saktaganova, Z.G. Politika Sovetskoii vlasti po otnosheniiu k religioznym organizatsiiam v Kazakhstane (30–40 gody XX veka) [The policy of the Soviet government towards religious organizations in Kazakhstan (30–40s of the XX century)]. *history-philosophy-vestnik.ksu.kz*. Retrieved from <https://history-philosophy-vestnik.ksu.kz/index.php/history-philosophy-vestnik/article/view/184/147> [in Russian].
- 15 Saktaganova, Z.G., Mazhitova, Zh.S., & Aimakhov, E.N. (2017). Gosudarstvo i religiia v sovetskoii istorii: etapy i osobennosti vzaimootnosheniia v Kazakhstane [State and religion in Soviet history: stages and peculiarities of relations in Kazakhstan]. *Vestnik Kazakhskogo Natsionalnogo Pedagogicheskogo Universiteta — Bulletin of Kazakh National Pedagogical University*, 2(53), 191–200 [in Russian].
- 16 Baltabayeva, A.M. Osobennosti religioznoi zhizni Kazakhstana v period Velikoi Otechestvennoi voiny [Features of the religious life of Kazakhstan during the Great Patriotic War]. *articlekz.com*. Retrieved from <https://articlekz.com/article/503> [in Russian].
- 17 Kokebayeva, G. (2015). The evolution of soviet power’s religious policy during the great patriotic war. *Asian Social Science*, 11(13), 235–239.
- 18 Bodeev, K., Saktaganova, Z., Myrzakhmetova, A., Ilyassov, Sh., & Kenzhegali, Zh. (2019). History of the development of religious organizations in central Kazakhstan. *Opcion*, 35(90-2), 772–783.
- 19 Bodeev, K.T. Metody i priemy borby sovetskoii vlasti s religioznymi organizatsiiami v 40–50-e gg. XX veka (na primere Tsentralnogo Kazakhstana) [Methods and techniques of the Soviet government’s fight against religious organizations in the 40s–50s of the XX century (on the example of Central Kazakhstan)]. *permgaspi.ru*. Retrieved from <https://www.permgaspi.ru/devatelnost/november-readings/noyabrskie-istoriko-arhivnye-chteniya-v-permskom-partarhive-v-2019-godu/materialy-nauchnoj-konferentsiii-noyabrskie-istoriko-arhivnye-chteniya-2019-g/metody-i-priemy-borby-sovetskoii-vlasti-s-religioznymi-organizatsiyami-v-40-50-e-gg-hh-veka-na-primere-tsentralnogo-kazahstana.html> [in Russian].
- 20 Saktaganova, Z.G., & Bodeev, K.T. (2020). Islam v povsednevnoi zhizni Tsentralnogo Kazakhstana v 1940-kh gg. [Islam in the daily life of Central Kazakhstan in the 1940s]. In «Reformy v povsednevnoi zhizni naseleniia Rossii: istoriia i sovremennost»: *sbornik materialov mezhdunarodnoi nauchnoi konferentsii — “Reforms in the Everyday Life of the Population of Russia: History and Modernity”*: *Proceedings of the International Scientific Conference* (pp. 250–254). Sankt-Peterburg [in Russian].
- 21 Bodeev, K.T., & Saktaganova, Z.G. (2020). Qaragandy oblysyndagy dini uymdar tarikhy (XX f. 60 zh. ortasy) [History of religious organizations in Karaganda region (mid-60s of the XX century)]. *Vestnik Karagandinskogo universiteta. Seriya: Istorii. Filosofiiia — Bulletin of Karaganda University. Series: History. Philosophy*, 97(1), 57–67 [in Kazakh].
- 22 Saktaganova, Z.G., & Iliasheva, Z.A. (2009). Vlast i religioznye konfessii v 1950-e gg. (na materialakh Tsentralnogo Kazakhstana) [Power and religious confessions in the 1950s (based on materials from Central Kazakhstan)]. In *Teoreticheskie i prikladnye issledovaniia v religiovedenii: sbornik statei, posviashchen pamiati doktora filosofskikh nauk, professora A.F. Upraviteleva — Theoretical and Applied Studies in Religious Studies: A Collection of Articles Dedicated to the Memory of Doctor of Philosophy, Professor A.F. Upravitelev*. Barnaul: Altaiskii gosudarstvennyi universitet [in Russian].

- 23 Saktaganova, Z.G. (2017). «Sindrom poslevoennoi zhertvennosti» i religioznaia povsednevnost naseleniia Tsentralnogo Kazakhstana v 1940–1950-e gg. [The “syndrome of post-war sacrifice” and the religious daily life of the population of Central Kazakhstan in the 1940s and 1950s.]. In *Stolitsa i provintsi: vzaimootnosheniia tsentra i regionov v istorii Rossii: Sbornik statei — The capital and the provinces: the relationship between the center and the regions in the history of Russia: A collection of articles*. Sankt-Peterburg: Leningrad. Gosudarstvennyi unistitut imeni A.S. Pushkina [in Russian].
- 24 Mazhitova, Z.S., & Ilyassova, K.M. (2022). Every day religious Life of German Population in North Kazakhstan region in the Late. *European Journal of Science and Theology*, 18(5), 105–122.
- 25 Schmidt, V. (2021). Nemetskie konfessii Kazakhstana v 1945–1960 gg. [German confessions of Kazakhstan in 1945–1960]. *Vostochnyi arkhiv — Oriental Archive*, 1(43), 85–90 [in Russian].
- 26 Soskovets, L.I. (2003). Pravovoe polozhenie religioznykh organizatsii v sovetskom gosudarstve [The legal status of religious organizations in the Soviet State]. *Uchenye zapiski Sankt-Peterburgskogo imeni V.B. Bobkova filiala Rossiiskoi tamozhennoi akademii — Scientific Notes of the V.B. Bobkov Saint Petersburg Branch of the Russian Customs Academy*, 1(20), 310–322 [in Russian].
- 27 Belyakova, N.A. (2008). Vlast i religioznye obedineniia v «pozdnem» SSSR: problema registratsii [Power and Religious associations in the “Late” USSR: the problem of Registration]. *Otechestvennaia istoriia — Russian history*, 4, 124–130 [in Russian].
- 28 Koroleva, L.A., & Molkin, A.N. (2014). Vlast i religii v SSSR. 1940–1980 gg. [Power and religion in the USSR. 1940–1980]. *History and archaeology*, 8. Retrieved from <https://history.snauka.ru/2014/08/1123> [in Russian].
- 29 Safronov, R.O. (2013). Izuchenie sekt v sovetskom religiovedenii: terminologii i podkhody [The study of sects in Soviet Religious Studies: terminology and approaches]. *Vestnik Pravoslavnogo Sviato-Tikhonovskogo gumanitarnogo universiteta. I: Bogoslovie. Filosofii — Bulletin of Saint Petersburg State University. I: Theology. Philosophy*, 5(49), 96–112 [in Russian].
- 30 Belyakova, N.A. (2019). Sovetskie po stilii, religioznye po sodержaniuu. Pisma veruiushchikh vo vlast v period pozdnego sotsializma [Soviet in style, religious in content. Letters of believers in power in the period of late Socialism]. *Rossiiskaia istoriia — Russian history*, 1, 207–214 [in Russian].
- 31 Beliakova, N.A. (2018). «Soobshchaem o prestuplenii protiv pravosudii...»: obrashcheniia i zhaloby veruiushchikh v brezhnevskom SSSR [“We report a crime against justice...”: appeals and complaints of believers in the Brezhnev USSR]. *Noveishaia istoriia Rossii — The modern history of Russia*, 8(3), 640–658 [in Russian].
- 32 Protoierei Sapsay, A. (2023). Pisma, zhaloby, obrashcheniia pravoslavnykh veruiushchikh Prikamii v organy vlasti v period pozdnego sotsializma [Letters, complaints, and appeals of Orthodox believers of the Kama Region to the authorities during the period of late Socialism]. *Vestnik sviato-filaretovskogo instituta — Bulletin of the St. Filaret Institute*, 48, 209–227 [in Russian].
- 33 Savin, A., & Denningkhaus, V. (2017). «Pisma vo vlast» kak modus religioznogo dissidentstva v brezhnevskuiu epokhu [“Letters to Power” as a mode of religious dissidence in the Brezhnev era]. *Rossii XXI — Russia XXI*, 6, 118–141 [in Russian].
- 34 Beglov, A., & Belyakova, N. (2021). Church Diplomacy in the Conditions of the Cold War: Directions of International Activity of the Russian Orthodox Church during the Period of Detente International Tension in the 1970s. *Istoriia*, 12(11).
- 35 Beglov, A.L. (2008). Tserkovnoe podpole v 1950–1980-e gg.: osnovnye tendentsii [The Church underground in the 1950s and 1980s: the main trends]. *Alfa i Omega — Alpha and Omega*, 3(53), 351–368 [in Russian].
- 36 Nosova, E.V. (2009). Deiatelnost Soveta po delam religioznykh kultov [Activities of the Council for Religious Cults]. *Vestnik Kyrgyzsko-Rossiiskogo Slavyanskogo Universiteta — Bulletin of the Kyrgyz-Russian Slavic University*, 9(5), 113–117 [in Russian].
- 37 Shkarovskii, M.V. (2009). *Russkaia Pravoslavnaia Tserkov v XX veke* [The Russian Orthodox Church in the 20th Century]. Moscow: Veche: Lepta [in Russian].
- 38 Marchenko, A.N. (2008). «Khrushchevskaia tserkovnaia reforma» i ee vliianie na vnutritserkovnuiu zhizn: po materialam uralskogo regiona (1958-1964 gg.) [“Khrushchev’s Church Reform” and its impact on inner-church life: based on the materials of the Ural region (1958-1964)]. *Extended abstract of Doctor’s thesis*. Moscow [in Russian].
- 39 Goncharenko, E.V. (2015). Modernizatsiia sovetskogo zakonodatelstva o religioznykh kultakh v 1964–1982 gg. (period L.I. Brezhneva) [Modernization of Soviet legislation on religious cults in 1964–1982 (the period of L.I. Brezhnev)]. In *Istoricheskie issledovaniia: sbornik materialov III Mezhdunarodoi nauchnoi konferentsii — Historical studies: collection of materials from the III International Scientific Conference*. Kazan: Buk [in Russian].
- 40 Stambolidi, A.V. (2009). Gosudarstvenno-konfessionalnye otnosheniia v SSSR v seredine 60-kh nachale 80-kh godov XX veka [State-confessional relations in the USSR in the mid-60s and early 80s of the XX century]. *Extended abstract of candidate’s thesis*. Moscow [in Russian].
- 41 Tabunshchikova, L.V. (2011). Religioznaia zhizn i ateisticheskaia deiatelnost sovetskogo gosudarstva v period «zastoia» (na materialakh Rostovskoi oblasti) [Religious life and atheistic activity of the Soviet state during the period of «stagnation» (based on the materials of the Rostov region)]. *Izvestiia vysshikh uchebnykh zavedenii. Severo-Kavkazskii region. Obshchestvennye nauki — News of higher educational institutions. The North Caucasus region. Social sciences*, 5, 40–43 [in Russian].
- 42 Odintsov, M.I. (2010). *Veroispovednye reformy v Sovetskom Soiuzie i v Rossii. 1985-1997 gg.* [Religious reforms in the Soviet Union and in Russia. 1985–1997]. Moscow: Rossiiskoe obiedinenie issledovatelei religii [in Russian].

- 43 Filippov, B.A. (2022). Vliianie sovetsko-amerikanskikh peregovorov 1985–1989 gg. na izmenenie sovetskoï veroisповедnoi politiki: istoricheskie i politicheskie konteksty vizita M. Gorbacheva v Vatikan [The influence of the Soviet-American negotiations of 1985-1989 on the Change of Soviet Religious Policy: historical and Political Contexts of Mikhail Gorbachev's visit to the Vatican]. *Vestnik Pravoslavnogo Sviato-Tikhonovskogo gumanitarnogo universiteta. Serii II: Istorii. Istorii Russkoi Pravoslavnoi Tserkvi — Bulletin of St. Tikhon's Orthodox University for the Humanities. Series II: History. The History of the Russian Orthodox Church*, 105, 124–153 [in Russian].
- 44 Maslova, I.I. (2015). Gosudarstvenno-konfessionalnaia politika v SSSR: povорот kursa v 1985–1988 gg. [State-confessional Policy in the USSR: a Course Reversal in 1985-1988]. *Izvestiia vysshikh uchebnykh zavedenii. Povolzhskii region. Gumanitarnye nauki — News of higher educational institutions. The Volga region. Humanities*, 4(36), 43–54 [in Russian].
- 45 Geraskin, Yu.V. (2009). Vzaimootnoshenii russkoi pravoslavnoi tserkvi, obshchestva i vlasti v kontse 1930-kh -1991 gg. (na materialakh oblastei Tsentralnykh Rossii) [The relationship between the Russian Orthodox Church, Society and government in the Late 1930s -1991 (based on materials from the regions of Central Russia)]. *Extended abstract of Doctor's thesis*. Moscow [in Russian].
- 46 Mukhtarova, G.D. (2007). Islam v sovetskom Kazakhstane [Islam in Soviet Kazakhstan]. *Extended abstract of Doctor's thesis*. Uralsk [in Russian].
- 47 Auanasova, B.M. (2007). Istoriiia evoliutsii religioznykh otnoshenii v Kazakhstane (na primere islama 1941–1991 gg.) [The history of the evolution of religious relations in Kazakhstan (using Islam as an example in 1941-1991)]. *Extended abstract of candidate's thesis*. Uralsk [in Russian].
- 48 Konusov, G.V. (2012). Musulmanskie religioznye instituty v Kazakhstane (istoriko-religiovedcheskii analiz) [Muslim religious institutes in Kazakhstan (historical and religious studies analysis)]. *Extended abstract of candidate's thesis*. Dushanbe [in Russian].
- 49 Akhmadullin, V.A. (2020). Gosudarstvenno-musulmanskie otnosheniia v SSSR v 1944-1965 gg.: dis. d-ra ist. nauk: Spets. 07.00.02 — «Otechestvennaia istoriia» [State-Muslim relations in the USSR in 1944-1965]. *Extended abstract of Doctor's thesis*. Moscow [in Russian].
- 50 Sultangalieva, A. (1996). *Islam v Kazakhstane: istoriia, etnichnost i obshchestvo* [Islam in Kazakhstan: history, ethnicity and society]. Almaty [in Russian].
- 51 Sultangalieva, A. Evoliutsiia islama v Kazakhstane [The evolution of Islam in Kazakhstan]. *Tsentralnaia Aziia i Kavkaz Central Asia and Caucasus*, 4 (5). Retrieved from https://ca-c.org.ru/journal/1999/cac-05-1999/st_06_sultangal.shtml [in Russian].
- 52 Mustafayeva, A.A. (2012). Istoricheskiï obzor evoliutsii islama v sovetskom Kazakhstane [Historical review of the evolution of Islam in Soviet Kazakhstan]. *Vestnik Kazakhskogo Natsionalnogo Universiteta — Kazakh National University Bulletin*, 3(60), 31–35 [in Russian].
- 53 Musagulova, A.B., & Arystanbekova, K.D. (2015). Borba sovetskoï vlasti protiv religii i ee otritsatelnye posledstviia v natsionalnom samosoznanii [The struggle of the Soviet government against religion and its negative consequences in national consciousness]. *Vestnik Kazakhskogo natsionalnogo pedagogicheskogo universiteta — Bulletin of Kazakh National Pedagogical University*, 1, 26–33 [in Russian].
- 54 Akhmadullin, V.A. (2016). *Deiatel'nost Sovetskogo gosudarstva i dukhovnykh upravlenii musulman po organizatsii palomnichestva (1944–1965 gg.): analiz istoricheskogo opyta i znachenie dlia sovremennosti* [The activities of the Soviet state and Muslim spiritual administrations in organizing pilgrimages (1944-1965): an analysis of historical experience and significance for modernity]. Moscow: Izdatelskii dom «Islamskaia kniga» [in Russian].
- 55 Akhmadullin, V.A. (2015). Deiatel'nost partiino-gosudarstvennogo apparata SSSR i Tsentralnogo Dukhovnogo Upravleniia Musulman po splocheniiu naseleniia i organizatsii pomoshchi frontu v pervom periode Velikoi Otechestvennoi voiny (iiun 1941 — noiabr 1942 gg.) [The activities of the Party and state Apparatus of the USSR and the Central Spiritual Administration of Muslims in rallying the population and organizing assistance to the front in the first period of the Great Patriotic War (June 1941 — November 1942)]. *Voennyi akademicheskii zhurnal — Military Academic Journal*, 2(6), 38–46 [in Russian].
- 56 Akhmadullin, V.A. (2016). Patrioticheskaia deiatel'nost musulman Rossii v gody Velikoi Otechestvennoi voiny (po materialam soveta po delam religioznykh kultov pri SNK SSSR) [Patriotic activity of Russian Muslims during the Great Patriotic War (based on the materials of the Council for Religious Cults under the Council of People's Commissars of the USSR)]. *Vestnik Rossiiskogo universiteta druzhby narodov, serii Istorii Rossii — Bulletin of the Peoples' Friendship University of Russia, the History of Russia series*, 1, 91–100 [in Russian].
- 57 Akhmadullin, V.A. (2019). Izuchenie osobennostei islamskoï zhizni Sovetom po delam religioznykh kultov pri SNK SSSR/SM SSSR v pervoe poslevoennoe desiatiletie [The study of the peculiarities of Islamic life by the Council for Religious Cults under the Council of People's Commissars of the USSR]. *Islamovedenie — Islamic Studies*, 10 (2), 59–75 [in Russian].
- 58 Mukhetdinov, D.V., Akhmadullin, V.A., & Akhmadullina, Zh.V. (2020). Patrioticheskie obrashcheniia rukovoditelei sovetskikh musulman k edinoversam v gody Velikoi Otechestvennoi voiny [Patriotic appeals of the leaders of Soviet Muslims to their co-religionists during the Great Patriotic War]. *Minbar. Islamic Studies*, 13(2), 307–329. Retrieved from <https://www.minbar.su/jour/article/view/758> [in Russian].

- 59 Khabibullina, Z. (2021). Spiritual administration of muslims of the European part of the USSR and Siberia in the system of international contacts of the USSR during the cold war (1944–1955). *History*, 8(106). Retrieved from <https://history.jes.su/s207987840016713-3-1/?sl=en> [in Russian].
- 60 Koroleva, L.A., & Korolev, A.A. (2014). *Islam, gosudarstvo, obshchestvo v SSSR vo vtoroi polovine 1960-kh — pervoi polovine 1980-kh gg. (po materialam Srednego Povolzhia)* [Islam, the state, and society in the USSR in the second half of the 1960s and the first half of the 1980s (based on materials from the Middle Volga region)]. Penza: PGUAS [in Russian].
- 61 Bennigsen, A., & Wimbush, S.E. (1986). *Muslims of the Soviet Empire: A Guide*. Indiana University Press.
- 62 Tasar, E. (2017). *Soviet and Muslim: the institutionalization of Islam in Central Asia, 1943–1991*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- 63 Akiner, S. (1986). *Islamic Peoples of the Soviet Union: with an Appendix. On the Non-muslim Turkic Peoples of the Soviet Union: an Historical and Statistical Handbook*. London: KPI.
- 64 Ro'i, Y. (1995). The Secularisation of Islam and the USSR's Muslim Areas. In *Muslim Eurasia: Conflicting Legacies*. London: Frank Cass.
- 65 Ro'i, Y. (2000). *Islam in the Soviet Union: From the Second World War to Gorbachev*. London: C. Hurst.
- 66 Kemper, M. (2009). *Studying Islam in the Soviet Union*. Amsterdam: University of Amsterdam Press.
- 67 Rorlich, A.-A. (1991). "Islam and Atheism: Dynamic Tension in Soviet Central Asia". In W. Fierman (Ed.), *Soviet Central Asia: The Failed Transformation*. London: Westview Press.
- 68 Jeff, E. (2021). *God Save the USSR: Soviet Muslims and the Second World War*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- 69 Shirley, E.B., & Rowe, M. Jr. (1989). *Candle in the wind: religion in the Soviet Union*. Washington: Ethics and Public Policy Center.
- 70 Rywkin, M. (1990). *Moscow's Muslim challenge: Soviet Central Asia*. New York: M.E. Sharpe.
- 71 Pospelovskii, D. (1984). *The Russian church under the Soviet regime, 1917–1982*. Crestwood, New York: St Vladimir's Seminary Press.
- 72 Pospelovskii, D.V. (1995). *Russkaia Pravoslavnaia Tserkov v XX veke* [The Russian Orthodox Church in the 20th century]. Moscow: Respublika [in Russian].
- 73 Pospelovskii, D.V. (2003). *Totalitarizm i veroisповедание* [Totalitarianism and religion]. Moscow: Bibleisko-bogoslovskii in-t sv. apostola Andreia [in Russian].
- 74 Pospelovskii, D.A. (1987). *History of Marxist-Leninist atheism and soviet antireligions policies*. London.
- 75 Fletcher, W. (1971). *The Russian Orthodox Church underground, 1917–1970*. Oxford.
- 76 Ellis, D. (1990) *Russkaia Pravoslavnaia Tserkov. Soglasie i inakomyслиe* [The Russian Orthodox Church. Consent and dissent]. London: Overseas Publications Interchange LTD.
- 77 Powell, D.E. (1975). *Antireligious propaganda in the Soviet Union: a study in mass persuasion*. Cambridge, MA: MIT Press.
- 78 Delaney, J. (1971). The Origins of Soviet Antireligious Organizations. In R. Marshall (Ed.), *Aspects of Religion in the Soviet Union, 1917–1967* (pp. 103–130). Chicago: Univ. of Chicago press.
- 79 Rothenberg, O.J. (1968). "The Legal Aspect of Religious Education in the Soviet Union". *Comparative Education Review*, 1, 68–75.
- 80 Smolkin, V. (2021). *Sviato mesto pusto ne byvaet: istoriia sovetskogo ateizma* [A Sacred Space Is Never Empty: a History of Soviet Atheism]. Moscow: Novoe literaturnoe obozrenie [in Russian].

Сведение об авторах

Алпыспаева Галья — доктор исторических наук, профессор кафедры истории Казахстана Казахского агротехнического исследовательского университета им. С. Сейфуллина, Астана, Казахстан, <https://orcid.org/0000-0002-0672-8292>

Жуман Гульмира — кандидат исторических наук, доцент кафедры истории Казахстана Казахского агротехнического исследовательского университета им. С. Сейфуллина, Астана, Казахстан, <https://orcid.org/0000-0002-9428-6411>

Джумагалиева Куляш — кандидат исторических наук, доцент кафедры истории Казахстана Казахского агротехнического исследовательского университета им. С. Сейфуллина, Астана, Казахстан, <https://orcid.org/0000-0003-4758-89>

Information about the authors

Alpyspaeva Galiya — Doctor of Historical Sciences, Professor of the Department of History of Kazakhstan, S. Seifullin Kazakh Agrotechnical Research University, Astana, Kazakhstan, <https://orcid.org/0000-0002-0672-8292>

Zhuman Gulmira — Candidate of Historical Sciences, Associate Professor, Department of History of Kazakhstan, S. Seifullin Kazakh Agrotechnical Research University, Astana, Kazakhstan, <https://orcid.org/0000-0002-9428-6411>

Dzhumagaliyeva Kulyash — Candidate of Historical Sciences, Associate Professor of the Department of History of Kazakhstan, S. Seifullin Kazakh Agrotechnical Research University, Astana, Kazakhstan, <https://orcid.org/0000-0003-4758-89>