## R.M. Sharipova\*, D.G. Shormanbayeva, Ye.N. Ivleva, O.M. Khmelnitskaya

Karaganda Technical University, Karaganda, Kazakhstan (E-mail: atkchild@gmail.com, yasmina-dinara@mail.ru, eivleva84@mail.ru, olesya\_khmelnitskaya@mail.ru)

## Freedom as Social and Philosophical Category (Comparative Analysis of Alash Intellectuals' Ideas and Philosophy of French Existentialists J.P. Sartre and A. Camus)

This article defines approaches to understanding freedom as a social and philosophical category through the spectacle of Kazakh intellectuals of Alash Party and existentialist philosophers from France (A. Camus, J.P. Sartre), performs the comparison and comparative analysis of understanding the phenomenon of freedom. In the history of philosophical thought, the concept of freedom underwent a long evolution; it was a subject of deep scientific sensemaking. This scientific interest has persisted up to the present day. From the research point of view, we obtain not only means helping to make possible a deeper understanding of the phenomenon of freedom, but also an opportunity to understand our modern world. The ideological inspirer, the leader of the Alash party was Alikhan Bukeykhan. This is an outstanding personality in the history of our state, due to him and other representatives of the Kazakh intellectuals; the foundation of independence was laid. Philosophical concepts of French existentialists, J.P. Sartre and A. Camus, in the context of freedom problem cause deep research interest since they not only consider the essence of human freedom but also aspects of freedom manifestations under conditions of social changes.

Keywords: philosophy of freedom, category, independence, necessity, responsibility, Alash Party, existentialism, absurd, justice, life purpose, choice, consciousness.

#### Introduction

Freedom is one of the main social and philosophical categories in the sensemaking of human existence. The relevance of the topic of freedom as a social and philosophical category is particularly significant at the modern stage of Kazakhstan's society development, during the modernization of public consciousness, the transformation of ideals and norms. As it was noted by the First President of the Republic of Kazakhstan N.A. Nazarbayev: "We are witnessing how the world begins new, fuzzy in many ways, historical cycle. It is impossible to take a place in the leading group while preserving previous consciousness and thinking model. That is why it is important to focus, change ourselves and via adaptation to the changing conditions, to take the best from that is given by the new epoch".

The objective of the research is a search for the basics of freedom in the philosophy of Alash and French existentialists and their descriptions. Research Tasks:

- to analyze and define the basics of freedom in the philosophy of the Alash;
- to analyze and define the basics of freedom in the philosophy of existentialists;
- to compare these basics of freedom in the philosophy of the Alash and philosophy of existentialists;
- to substantiate that modern modernization processes in Kazakhstan society are impossible without an independent, free-thinking personality.

The object of the research is freedom as a social and philosophical category. The subject is gnoseological substantiation of freedom.

Brief characteristics of the structure: this research will attempt to analyze and synthesize the basics of freedom through the spectacle of Kazakh intellectuals of the Alash Party who laid the foundation of Kazakh-stan Independence and existentialists A. Camus who defined the special characteristics in understanding the phenomenon of freedom.

### **Experimental**

The methodological basis of the study is the use of historical, sociocultural, and existential approaches developed in the fundamiental works of foreign and domestic researchers, which allow us to give the most

<sup>\*</sup> Corresponding author's e-mail: atkchild@gmail.com

complete analysis of the concept of "freedom", as well as to draw parallels with the modern interpretation of this concept and the degree of its importance in society today. In addition, a set of methods of sociophilosophical theoretical analysis was used, including analysis, synthesis, abstraction, deduction.

The problem of "freedom" has always been at the center of scientific thought. In each period of time, taking into account its features, a whole new definition of the term "freedom" appeared in philosophy. In particular, in the philosophy of existentialism, the semantic meaning of the term varied greatly between scientists [1; 276]. According to the researcher Sofienko Z. "However, a truly philosophical understanding of freedom is the idea of it as an idea, the highest spiritual value" [2; 49].

The philosophical dictionary distinguishes the following definitions of freedom [3; 21]:

freedom coincides with the health of the body, which is determined by Leriche as "life in the silence of organs". An ill person feels subordinate to his body: he is not free to act voluntarily.

freedom coincides with propensity. A person is free if he can implement his wishes (Epicureanism).

freedom is a possibility to choose.

freedom is an implementation of will. Freedom is not what we do, but how we do that.

freedom as a social category is related to person's well-being. A country cannot be free if its population lives on the edge.

The creative and scientific intelligentsia of Kazakhstan played a huge role in achieving independence in the late 19th and early 20th centuries. It was they who were the leaders of the political party "Alash" and the Government of Alash, who laid the foundation for Kazakh independence. A number of publications and studies are devoted to the study of their role in the formation of independent Kazakhstan: Asylbekov M. [4; 81], Zhusupbekova M. [5; 11], Zhanbosinova A. [6; 132], the monograph by Amanzholova D. "Alash: historical the meaning of democratic choice" [7; 206]. The monograph is one of the first works in Kazakh historiography, which explores the history of the Alash movement - the movement of Kazakh reformers in the first quarter of the twentieth century. The monograph enriches our understanding of the dramatic fate of national movements. Based on a large number of new sources that were not previously included in the scientific circulation of documents and materials, the author analyzes the origin and development of the liberal tradition in Kazakhstan.

Understanding the course of history inevitably raises questions about the role of this or that person in it: did she change the course of history; whether such a change was inevitable or not; what would have happened without this person? From the obvious truth that it is people who make history, an important problem of the philosophy of history about the relationship between regular and accidental follows, which, in turn, is closely related to the question of the role of the individual. An outstanding person in the history of our state is Alikhan Bukeykhan. The ideological inspirer, the leader of the Alash party, due to him and other representatives of the Kazakh intellectuals, the foundation of the independence was laid.

The Alash Party was established as a force capable of providing Kazakh people with autonomy, which was capable of preventing anarchy that emerged after the events of the October revolution of 1917. The Alash Party offered an up-to-date program of world order renovation, which accounted for Kazakh people's interests, as well as analysis of the geopolitical and social situation. The whole program was united under the movement named "Alash". The party fought for the abolition of private property for lands and its transfer to common use, with its arranging as non-governmental property. Alash Orda representatives strived to implement human rights for free expression of opinions, personal integrity, the introduction of local governments, court reforms, separation of church from the state. Significant attention was paid to education and science development. They fought for free education, teaching in the national language, establishing schools and universities with the Kazakh language of instruction. Alash Party leader, Alikhan Bukeykhan did not want to put up with the impairment of rights of his people on their land. Due to the high level of gained knowledge, professionalism, ability to managerial reflection, oratorical skill he defended the interests of his homeland and people at the expense of his life. Alikhan Bukeykhan had written that homeland destiny is above all benefits. He constantly turned to his people with the words that the lands, on which we lived, had been received by our forefathers, ancestors, who were blood-related to us, so we had to value them, fight for our land, for our independence. Alikhan Bukeykhan is a hero, one of the founders of the national liberation movement, but he would not achieve such results if he did not continually strive for knowledge. He tirelessly widened his horizons, formed a system of life values, beliefs, and affirmations. It is such people who made a huge contribution to the history and culture of modern Kazakhstan. They started to systematically form beliefs regarding the opportunities and paths of Kazakh formation in Eurasia, and equitable relationship with Russia, democracy, and national autonomy with warranties for minorities. Alikhan Bukeykhan served his people

until last. On September 27, 1937, the Military Collegium of the USSR Supreme Court based on allegation sentenced Alikhan Bukeykhan to the firing squad. At interrogations and in court he assumed all the responsibility for the actions of the Alash Party, trying to protect the participants of the movement. The same day, the Military Court brought the sentence into action. A. Bukeykhan was executed by shooting the same day in Moscow.

Today, Kazakhstan is a free, democratic state, and public relations are regulated by the law, rights of all citizens are respected, cultural progress of the nation is observed. The main message of A.Bukeykhan was to be scrupulous, honest, responsible, compassionate, involved citizens of our country. This decent heritage of A.Bukeykhan, we, Kazakh people, are obliged to bring to and support for the next generations.

Further, we will analyze the philosophy of the French existentialist: J.P. Sartre and A. Camus in the context of the problem of freedom. Their philosophical concepts cause deep research interest since they not only consider the essence of human freedom but also aspects of freedom manifestations under conditions of social changes. From the research point of view, they give us not only means helping to make possible a deeper understanding of the phenomenon of freedom, but also an opportunity to understand our modern world.

Both philosophers J.P. Sartre and A. Camus were born in a difficult time: military events of 1914–1918, their maturity fell on the 1940s, in the second half of their lives the world was exposed to the threat of atomic and hydrogen weapons. Concerns of J.P. Sartre and A. Camus were quite grounded; shocks of unprecedented scale destroyed one spiritual principle of the society after another. A. Camus wrote that modern human faced total ideologies justifying inhuman attitudes towards a person.

J.P. Sartre considered freedom in the context of social reality. In his opinion, human is fated for freedom. Freedom is immanently inherent with human existence, it means every human is a conscious creature and correspondingly he has an understanding of freedom. J.P. Sartre writes, "We are fated to be free, and our freedom, perhaps, is the only thing that cannot be waived by us" [8; 324]. Freedom is a way of consciousness existence. J.P. Sartre states that freedom precedes essentiality. Freedom is the existence of a person, his interests, his creations, and activity choice. Only after a large distance of his life, we can state who this person is and what his content and essence are.

To understand the essence of the phenomenon of freedom, J.P. Sartre introduces the concept of necessity. In the philosophy of J.P. Sartre, necessity is the opposite of freedom. Despite his focal point stating that "existence (freedom) precedes essence", he acknowledges that necessity (non-freedom) presents in the everyday life of humans. Necessity does not give a creative insight of a person's essence, enchains him, a person ceases to be an idea. He performs routine, daily actions that do not require conscious choice or any creative act. He believes that either freedom overcomes necessity, or necessity enslaves freedom.

A. Camus interprets freedom to a certain extend similarly. However, A. Camus unlike J.P. Sartre states that transfer from routine, from non-freedom to freedom, to conscious existence is understanding of absurd of his existence by a person (certain the point of no return to previous existence). By A. Camus, freedom is not irresponsibility. Vice versa, each person is responsible for actions made. A. Camus does not speak of legal responsibility; he speaks of freedom as of socially conscious choice, a choice made by a moral side of a person. True freedom is not a constant category, it should be conquered, be fought for. It consists in the ability to fight for your rights, independence, honor and dignity of a person. He states that not the upper classes, layers fight for freedom, and this is understandable. In his paper, A Camus writes: "Working intellectuals and workers had made freedom real and given strength to go forward to it, until it became a thinking principle, air, without which we could not survive, which we breathed in, without noticing, till the moment, when suddenly having lost it we felt that we were dying" [9; 412].

Human is deeply mistaken about his freedom. He believes that daily actions and rituals, setting goals, and achieving these goals are a certain indicator of freedom, but this is not the case. This is a simple stay in the world, fulfilling obligations and requirements. Once such a mistaken "freedom" can lead to an understanding of the absurdity of human existence. If a person comes to such an understanding, he becomes different. He begins to resist, his system of value orientations changes, and an indestructible desire occurs to live as he had never lived before that moment. Therefore, even in the face of death, a person is not scary, as he has learned the real taste of life, a person dies not entirely: physically, but not spiritually. Spiritually he comprehended the essence of the human stay in this world. He understood the true purpose of a person, which consists in the ability to be and live in the moment, having learned to appreciate everything worldly. A truly free person can understand himself, his wishes, and oppose everything that is wrongful about a person, and his life. This is not anarchy. This is a conscious reality, which encourages a person to think in other cate-

gories, which forms a special system of values. As A. Camus notes, understanding true freedom becomes possible not for everyone, and only in those cases that push us to our limits. A person with a meaningful determination to live contrary to his previous existence causes special piety and requires special protection and assistance, according to A. Camus. In his work, he calls on: "You sneer: well, what does it mean to save a person? However, I will cry you with full force: it means not to mangle him; it means to bet on justice... "[3; 438]. Later, A. Camus comes to interpreting freedom via rebellion. The philosophers wrote these lines with deep pain and disappointment in the social order. Humans must be free. No one (whether power or ideological principles of society, another person, a group of people) has a right to encroach on this freedom. A person remains Human as long as freely makes decisions, freely chooses, and listens to the "weak noise of hope born as a spiritually driven one and supported by millions of one-aloners" [10; 218]. With their humanity and compassion to compatriots, they served the people and inspired them with these qualities.

### Results and Discussion

The research group has chosen this topic due to its deep scientific and research interest and relevance. Let us compare basics of freedom in the philosophy Alash and philosophy of the French existentialists;

- historic significance. Despite the short-term existence of the Alash movement, it had tremendous importance for the formation of consciousness of all subsequent generations. Alash Orda intellectuals at the beginning of the century put forward the idea of the sovereignty of Kazakhstan. French existentialism also, as the Alash movement in its time, made immense changes to the ontological basics of the world order;
- causal relationship of emergence. The emergence of the Alash movement and mature French existentialism represented by J.P. Sartre and A.Camus was not groundless; it was a testimony to the depressiveness of social development, ill-being, which wandered along spiritual off-road;
- methodological grounds. Having compared the program of Alikhan Bukeykhan with the theory of French existentialists represented by J.P. Sartre and A.Camus, we believe that it complies with the theory of Sartre "freedom necessity";
- principles. Party leader, Alikhan Bukeykhan, just like J.P. Sartre and A. Camus slightly later, fought for the human right for free expression of opinion, personal integrity;
- characteristics of authors. Alikhan Bukeykhan, J.P. Sartre, A.Camus were qualified as moralists, ethical persons capable of affecting the course of history. (Alikhan Bukeykhan "son of his people", A.Camus "conscience of the West");
  - the focal point. Be involved with your history, people.

Alash Orda representatives strived to implement human rights for free expression of opinions, personal integrity, the introduction of local governments, court reforms, separation of church from the state. The main message of A. Bukeykhan was to be scrupulous, honest, responsible, compassionate, involved citizens of our country. An impartial analysis shows that the items of the Alash movement program correspond to democratic provisions, they do not hurt national interests, remove estate privileges. The priorities of the Alash Party included freedom of personality, struggle for independence, the construction of a free, enlightened society.

Representatives of existential philosophy J.P. Sartre, A. Camus, as well as the intellectuals of Alash, pay great attention to the study of human freedom. Moreover, as described above, freedom is understood by J.P. Sartre and A. Camus as an integral attribute of human existence. Freedom is a phenomenon of human existence, to which it is possible to come if you realize the absurdity of human existence. A truly free person can understand himself, his wishes, and oppose everything that is wrongful about a person, and his life. This is not anarchy. This is a conscious reality, which encourages a person to think in other categories, which forms a special system of values. As A. Camus notes, understanding true freedom becomes possible not for everyone, and only in those cases that push us to our limits. A person with a meaningful determination to live contrary to his previous existence causes special respect.

### Conclusions

In the history of philosophical thought, the concept of freedom underwent a long evolution; it was a subject of deep scientific sensemaking. This scientific interest has persisted up to the present day. From the research point of view, we have obtained not only means helping to make possible a deeper understanding of the phenomenon of freedom, but also an opportunity to understand our modern world. Freedom is one of the main social and philosophical categories in the sensemaking of human existence.

The relevance of the topic of freedom as a social and philosophical category is particularly significant at the modern stage of Kazakhstan's society development, during the modernization of public consciousness,

the transformation of ideals and norms. Methodological basis of the research is the use of historic, social-cultural, and existentialist approaches. The scientific novelty of the research consists in a comparative analysis of the philosophy of the Alash movement and the philosophy of French existentialism represented by J.P. Sartre and A. Camus, in the search for integrative gnoseological grounds in understanding the essence of freedom, their transfer, and testing in further research works. Comparative analysis of their programs and theories has a fundamental similarity: a human-oriented approach, an attempt to find decent conditions for human existence in this world. Justice, solidarity, respect for personality, dignity, honor, non-violence are unified grounds in understanding freedom by the philosophers. These thinkers are involved with the future generations; they called on society to change the worldview attitudes towards humans and their dignity. The idea of future justice is awareness of the current injustice.

The true purpose of humans, according to the analysis made, allows concluding that it is the ability to be and live in the moment, having learned to appreciate everything worldly. A truly free person can understand himself, his wishes, and oppose everything wrongful about a person, and his life. This is not anarchy. This is a conscious reality, which encourages a person to think in other categories, which forms a special system of values.

Due to his knowledge, high professionalism, abilities for managerial reflection, oratorical skill he defended the interests of his homeland and people at the expense of his life. Alikhan Bukeykhan had written that homeland destiny is above all benefits. He constantly turned to his people with the words that the lands, on which we lived, had been received by our forefathers, and ancestors, who were blood-related to us, so we had to value them, fight for our land, for our independence. Alikhan Bukeykhan is a hero, one of the founders of the national liberation movement. The thinkers are united in that human becomes a person only when he thinks freely, can freely express his thoughts, and at the same time feel his responsibility to other people and society. Therefore, set by Alikhan Bukeykhan, J.P. Sartre, A. Camus issues of freedom, responsibility, choice, and necessity will always be relevant as long as humanity exists.

The analysis conducted in this research has great practical significance. Definition of the grounds of the phenomenon of freedom, morality, justice, reference points for the future can be used in researching modern political events.

## Список литературы

- 11 Приходько С.В. Феномен свободы в философии экзистенциализма / С.В. Приходько // Научные ведомости. Сер. Философия. Социология. Право. 2013. № 16 (159). Вып. 25. С. 276–278.
- 12 Софиенко М.Б. Свобода как философская проблема / М.Б. Софиенко // Context and Reflection: Philosophy of the World and Human Being. 2018. Vol. 7, Is. 3A. P. 48–55.
  - 13 Сайт словарей и энциклопедий [Электронный ресурс]. Режим доступа: https://academic.ru/
- 14 Асылбеков М.Х. Об эволюции политических взглядов лидера движения Алаш Алихана Букейхана [Электронный ресурс] / М.Х. Асылбеков // Сервис в России и за рубежом. 2013. № 2 С. 80–90. Режим доступа: https://cyberleninka.ru/article/n/ob-evolyutsii-politicheskih-vzglyadov-lidera-dvizheniya-alash-alihana-bukeyhana
- 15 Жусупбекова М.К. Роль алашординцев в становлении независимого Казахстана / М.К. Жусупбекова // Молодой ученый. 2017 № 20.1 (154.1). С. 10—12.
- 16 Жанбосинова А.С. Краткая энциклопедия истории Алаш и Алаш-Орда / А.С. Жанбосинова, ред. С.К. Игибаев, Г.М. Ахметова. Усть-Каменогорск: Берель, 2013. 204 с.
- 17 Аманжолова Д.А. Алаш: исторический смысл демократического выбора: моногр. / Д.А. Аманжолова. Алматы: Таймас, 2013. 400 с.
  - 18 Сартр Ж.П. Экзистенциализм это гуманизм / В кн. Сумерки богов / Ж.П. Сартр. М.: Политиздат, 1989. 344 с.
- 19 Камю А. Творчество и свобода: c6/ / А. Камю; пер. с фр. / сост. и предисл. К. Долгова. Комментарий С. Зенкина. М.: Радуга, 1990. 608 с.
  - 20 Камю А. Избранное: сб. / А. Камю; пер. с фр. / сост. и предисл. С. Великовского. М.: Радуга, 1989. 464 с.

## Р.М. Шарипова, Д.Г. Шорманбаева, Е.Н. Ивлева, О.М. Хмельницкая

# Бостандық әлеуметтік-философиялық категория ретінде (Алаш зиялыларының идеялары мен француз экзистенциалистері Ж.П. Сартр мен А. Камюдің философиясын салыстырмалы талдау)

Мақалада Алаш партиясының қазақ зиялылары мен Францияның экзистенциалист-философтары (Ж.П. Сартр мен А. Камю) тұрғысынан бостандықты әлеуметтік-философиялық санат ретінде түсіну тәсілдері ашылған, бостандық феноменін түсінуде салыстырулар мен салыстырмалы талдау жүргізілген. Философиялық ой тарихында еркіндік ұғымы ұзақ эволюциядан өтті, терең ғылыми түсіну тақырыбы болды. Бұл ғылыми қызығушылық бүгінгі күнге дейін сақталды. Зерттеу тұрғысынан біз еркіндік феноменін терең түсінуге мүмкіндік беретін құралдарды ғана емес, сонымен қатар қазіргі заманымызды түсінуге мүмкіндік аламыз. Идеялық шабыттандырушы, Алаш партиясының көшбасшысы Әлихан Бөкейхан болды. Бұл біздің мемлекетіміздің тарихындағы көрнекті тұлға, оның және қазақ зиялыларының басқа да өкілдерінің арқасында Тәуелсіздіктің іргетасы қаланды. Француз экзистенциалистері Ж.П. Сартра мен А. Камустің философиялық тұжырымдамалары адам бостандығының мәнін ғана емес, сонымен бірге қоғамдық өзгерістер жағдайында еркіндіктің көріну аспектілерін қарастыратындықтан бостандық мәселелері контексінде терең зерттеушілік қызығушылық тудырады.

*Кілт сөздер:* бостандық философиясы, категория, Тәуелсіздік, қажеттілік, жауапкершілік, Алаш партиясы, экзистенциализм, абсурд, әділдік, өмірдің мәні, таңдау, сана.

## Р.М. Шарипова, Д.Г. Шорманбаева, Е.Н. Ивлева, О.М. Хмельницкая

# Свобода как социально-философская категория (сравнительный анализ идей интеллигенции Алаш и философии французских экзистенциалистов Ж.П. Сартра и А. Камю)

В статье раскрыты подходы к пониманию свободы как социально-философской категории с позиций казахской интеллигенции партии Алаш и философов-экзистенциалистов Франции (А. Камю, Ж.П. Сартр), проводятся сопоставления и сравнительный анализ в понимании феномена свободы. В истории философской мысли понятие «свобода» прошло длительную эволюцию, было предметом глубокого научного осмысления. Этот научный интерес сохранился и до настоящего времени. С исследовательской точки зрения мы получаем не только средства, с помощью которых, возможно, более углубленное понимание феномена свободы, но и возможности понять нашу современность. Идейным вдохновителем, лидером партии Алаш был Алихан Букейхан. Это выдающаяся личность в истории нашего государства, благодаря ему и другим представителям казахской интеллигенции был заложен фундамент Независимости. Философские концепции французских экзистенциалистов Ж.П. Сартра и А. Камю в контексте проблемы свободы вызывают глубокий исследовательский интерес не только потому, что рассматривают сущность человеческой свободы, но и аспекты проявления свободы в условиях социальных изменений.

*Ключевые слова:* философия свободы, категория, Независимость, необходимость, ответственность, партия «Алаш», экзистенциализм, абсурд, справедливость, смысл жизни, выбор, сознание.

#### References

- 1 Prikhodko, S.V. (2013). Fenomen svobody v filosofii ekzistentsializma [The phenomenon of freedom in the philosophy of existentialism] // Nauchnye vedomosti. Seriia Filosofiia. Sotsiologiia. Pravo Scientific bulletin. Philosophy series. Sociology. Right, 25, 16 (159), 276–278 [in Russian].
- 2 Sofienko, M.B. (2018). Svoboda kak filosofskaia problema [Freedom as a philosophical problem]. Context and Reflection: Philosophy of the World and Human Being. 7, 3A, 48–55 [in Russian].
  - 3 Sait slovarei i entsiklopedii [The site of dictionaries and encyclopedias]. Retrieved from https://academic.ru/ [in Russian].
- 4 Asylbekov, M.Kh. (2013). Ob evoliutsii politicheskikh vzgliadov lidera dvizheniia Alash Alikhana Bukeikhana [On the evolution of the political views of the leader of the Alash movement Alikhan Bukeikhan]. *Servis v Rossii i za rubezhom Service in Russia and abroad*, 2, 80–90. Retrieved from https://cyberleninka.ru/article/n/ob-evolyutsii-politicheskih-vzglyadov-lidera-dvizheniya-alash-alihana-bukeyhana [in Russian].
- 5 Zhusupbekova, M.K. (2017). Rol alashordintsev v stanovlenii Nezavisimogo Kazakhstana [The role of Alashordins in the formation of independent Kazakhstan]. *Molodoi uchenyi Young Scientist*, 20.1 (154.1), 10–12 [in Russian].
- 6 Zhanbosinova, A.S. (2013). Kratkaia entsiklopediia istorii Alash i Alash-Orda [A short encyclopedia of the history of Alash and Alash-Orda]. S.K. Igibaev, G.M. Akhmetova (Ed.). Ust-Kamenogorsk: Berel [in Russian].

- 7 Amanzholova, D.A. (2013). Alash: istoricheskii smysl demokraticheskogo vybora [Alash: the historical meaning of democratic choice]. Almaty: Taimas [in Russian].
- 8 Sartr, Zh.P. (1989). Ekzistentsializm eto gumanizm. V knige: Sumerki bogov [Existentialism is humanism. In the book: Twilight of the Gods]. Moscow: Politizdat [in Russian].
- 9 Kamiu, A. (1990). Tvorchestvo i svoboda: sbornik [Creativity and freedom. Collection]. Compilation and foreword by K. Dolgov. Comment by S. Zenkin. Moscow: Raduga [in Russian].
- 10 Kamiu, A. (1989). Izbrannoe: sbornik [Favorites: A collection]. Compiled and Prefixed by S. Velikovsky. Moscow: Raduga [in Russian].